
BARCELONA – Geo TLDs .CITIES Conference
Wednesday, October 24, 2018 – 13:30 to 18:30 CEST
ICANN63 | Barcelona, Spain

UNIDENTIFIED MALE:

The 21st century is the century of cities. [inaudible] cities, new mobility, cities where everything is going to be replicating and applicating for the next digital [inaudible] in technology. And for that, it's very it's very important to share all these ideas of domains and Internet. The geographic domain Barcelona was from the beginning in the first level with New York City and cities like [first year] sharing the idea to have a domain of Barcelona. We find this is very important. Countries, [inaudible] countries, Europe, all of these big domains are very important, but we as a city and as a city brand – and I guess we share this with many cities in the world – this means a lot to us to have a domain with the name of Barcelona, and I imagine it's the same for many of those cities.

This is an introduction for our today's debate because we have another [inaudible] on this. [inaudible] is not in this, but we have a very interesting panel. I'm going to introduce you shortly, all of the panelists. They will do a presentation. And at the end, after the presentations, we will have time to questions and answers.

Our first speaker is Andrea Beccalli. I'm sorry for the names. I don't know if I will say very well the names. Andrea Beccalli is a stakeholder of engagement director of ICANN. He works at ICANN to establish relations with European government, Internet communities,

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

[inaudible] agencies, as well as European international government organizations. He will talk about the role of ICANN, and I guess it's a very important role, in the new domains. Andrea, if you want to start. Thank you.

ANDREA BECCALLI:

Thank you. Thank you all, and welcome to the ICANN meeting for those that just came for this session. It's a pleasure for us to host this first .CITIES event. It's actually an idea that we started discussing at another ICANN event with some of the community members. At the GDD summit in Madrid, it was last year or I think two years ago. I don't recall now. Two years ago, yeah.

Then it further evolved, and I had the pleasure to get in contact and to meet people at the Barcelona city hall and present to them this idea. I said, "ICANN is coming to your town. It's the first time that ICANN comes to Spain, to Barcelona, and it is a particular year for us. It's the 20th anniversary of ICANN. It's the Annual General Meeting, meaning that this is the main meeting of ICANN of the year. Plus, the government of Spain, recognizing the importance of those topics, hosted this past Monday a high-level government meeting."

And I said, "I think you, as many other cities, have a unique interest as you not only host the event but you are also now a part of the Internet infrastructure." Because when you run a top-level domain, you are by all effect a part of the Internet infrastructure, of the Internet DNS. So [naturally] cities are now [capitals] and are key nodes of our Internet experience. They're all [inaudible] cities and [inaudible] government,

but they're also running a domain. They're also part of the Internet core infrastructure, so it's something that it makes you think and it makes you also appreciate the value.

The idea was very well welcomed, and we worked on designing this event. And I'm very glad that it finally came through. It's a first, so it will be an experiment within ICANN. I'm sure and I hope that there will be more than those as we go around the globe with the ICANN meetings and cities are getting more and more recognized as key nodes of our living.

Actually, we are living in very interesting times where globalization seems on the retreat but the importance and role of cities in that is on the rise. The challenges of the Internet evolution and in services [disruption] that they're having is well felt, particularly in cities and probably the solution will also come from cities. We are in a world where looking at global solution is becoming more and more difficult, but probably tackling issues at the local is a good way to go forward.

Just a few words on ICANN for those of you that are not familiar. In ICANN we do help the development of a key layer of the Internet, the DNS. We do that in a bottom-up, inclusive manner. What you see here is a week long of meetings, conferences, but many of those are actually working sessions. We meet three times per year to work, to decide, to discuss, and to hopefully agree in a consensus-based manner on how the DNS should develop.

Through this process, the idea of opening up the space of the DNS, of expanding this core part of the Internet came through now more than,

I think, six years ago when there was a decision taken by the ICANN board representing the community to open up the domain name space and to basically liberalize the domain name market, a top-level domain. It took some years to develop the rules and to take the decision, but once it was launched it took many of us, for sure the ICANN staff and people within ICANN, by surprise by the number and the interest. We didn't expect all those applications. We didn't expect so much interest. Actually, ICANN had to do some good work to ensure that the process to go through all these applications was solid and was timely.

In the whole landscape, probably one interesting thing has been the geo TLDs. In ICANN we love acronyms, so every time there is a chance to put an acronym we'll go for that. So the geographic top-level domain names have been something that has presented itself as a very strong category in the whole landscape. Cities, regions going through the process to say, "I think we can run a space on the Internet. We can become a node of the whole Internet." So you have a long list of cities, a good list of regions, and many of them in Spain. I was like that's even more of a push to get this event happening because Spain presents a very interesting landscape from .gal, .eus, to .barcelona, and .madrid. It's I think the country that has the most dot geos if I'm not wrong.

So within ICANN we are now discussing whether to open up the gTLD program, how to do that, according to what rules. It will take some more time, but I think the stakeholders and everybody interest in this program, we learned from the experiences so far. I'm sure that one of the more successful experiences and most looked after and sought

after is the one of the geo TLDs just as an observer of this work. So I think you also open up a space and a part for other geo [realities] across the globe to look at the value of that.

The big question and the big question mark and the big challenge for the future is how to further design the geo top-level domain names. How can it become an integral part of the city recognition on the Internet? This is something that I think goes well beyond the DNS itself. It goes into how does it interplay with the evolution of the Internet and the use that the Internet is experiencing through the mobile or through the explosion of IoT.

I think there are good challenges ahead for how the cities are playing this game, and a discussion like that one will serve as an opportunity to confront and to see which are the good practices to share ideas. And I encourage you to do so because, again, now you are a full part of the Internet although you don't realize this probably. You do run a core resource, and with that you are even more entitled to shape how it evolves.

We have this tendency of thinking that innovation takes the lead and the new social network or the new application will help us in matching our love or finding the car or [renting] a scooter. But it is not only that. There is a lot of space for imagination and looking into public services and the role that cities have in shaping that.

Actually, I think there is a big ask for that. Every day there are new concerns about this kind of Internet that we are seeing now is not that positive. There are some aspects of that Internet that are probably too

disruptive, that are getting into touching some core values in some institutions like democracies and elections. I mean, we all read all the same news and worrying signs on what the Internet can become.

Well then, make sure that you assume, you take full ownership of your role as cities and now as key nodes of the Internet infrastructure to design that and to say, “Well, there is a different path, and cities can be represented and present a value of public interest, of citizenship, of the Internet but being bound physically into one particular region, one particular community.”

With that, I’ll let the discussion flow and look forward to having some exchange with you. Thank you again, and looking forward to the rest of the afternoon and to the next time bigger. I’m sure it will be bigger.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: And better.

ANDREA BECCALLI: And better. No. Better, no. That’s not good. It will be tough. Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Thank you, Andrea. Next to me, I have Amadeu Abril. He’s the chief policy advisory of CORE, an association which provides technical operation and legal management service to domains, such as .cat, .museum, .paris, [inaudible], etc.

AMADEU ABRIL:

Okay, microphone is my best friend. Good afternoon. And not only say good afternoon, I would like to provide you a little piece of local culture. When [Luis] said good morning, he was not wrong. Here is the morning for us until midday starts at 2:00 and sometime at 4:00 afternoon starts. But anyway, we will follow the ICANN standard and we will say good afternoon to everybody.

So we'll go a little back in history. My role here is to explain how these city, geo, and other local communities or kind of communities came to the Internet. And then I will explain the reason we're following at the time in .cat in 2004 – 2004 was the end of the discussion.

Indeed, the question is that some people wanted to have a TLD on the Internet for any reason, either because they wanted to make money which is perfectly legitimate because they had an idea. They thought this could serve the interest of some users as a perfectly legitimate idea. And some other people wanted to have their own identifier, to be able to be identified on the Internet as being something, be that the aeronautic industry or the museums or in that case the Catalans. You know, the strange people that live around the CCIB in Barcelona.

There was not a procedure for that, so we were following that procedure. We want a TLD for us without knowing [inaudible]. I remember that in '95 I talked with Jon Postel for the first time. We discussed this. We discussed that on the phone because Jon advised me not to do it in an e-mail. I explained him that. He said, "Well, if you want, you can file a request by e-mail. I will log that, and then I will

answer you that this is impossible.” I said, “Okay, I don’t write you e-mail,” and we look for a way.

The idea is that indeed we had different logics. On one side, you had the logic of the passports and identity cards. I mean, country codes, we had many of them. If you’re a country or something that’s in the list with countries however you define country, you will get a ccTLD one [day] or another. The other logic was somehow the activity, the economic logic, you are doing commercial or non-commercial activities. And you have a .com or a .biz, or you are working [cooperatives] or in your area activities museum or the aeronautic industry so we have .museum and .aero. And they were really the only two logics.

So when we’re trying here to discuss where we could fit, I said that we needed to change the logic. That it was not written anywhere that only the passport identity card or the credit card were the only criteria for organizing and identifying things on the Internet. So I told him we should use the dictionary, the language. So instead of applying for a TLD for Catalonia or the Catalans, we set these TLDs for communications in Catalan. That is those that use that language to communicate on the Internet, which makes absolute sense in the terms that you use very seldom your passport on the Internet but normally if you communicate, most of the times you communicate through language, be that speech or written form and you do that in language with people that understand your language. Now there are some translators, but still you tend to communicate with people that use any of the languages that you also are able to use.

That was the idea to put that as the dictionary. Then the reasons for doing that, we had between 1995 and 2004 a lot of time to think what we wanted to do, why we wanted a TLD. Then we started where everybody starts. I want me, my group, my city, my company, whatever on the Internet. I want to identify me as being myself. And identity is an important thing.

Now my advice to you all is if you only have that, don't run for a TLD yet. Think about other cases and uses. Because just putting a flag there, a flag in the political sense or commercial sense or organizational sense, is nice. It's what brand TLDs are doing, but most of them don't know what to do with their TLDs afterwards.

Then the second thing that was very clear for us is that we are a language, but there languages in languages. Catalan is not English or Spanish or Russian. Catalan is a language that is relatively [invisible] even if it's the [30th] language on the Internet and one of those 60 that Unesco believes that is not in danger of disappearing out of the 6,000 that exist, so imagine how the others are. It's a language that has struggled to really compete and exist in the middle and long term.

This is not something that's solved by laws or money. This is something that's also only solved by social prestige, reputation, people believing that they are using an important language and not a second-level language. So the idea is Catalan is important enough that not only do you have schools or newspapers but it has a top-level domain. It plays in the champions league of the Internet. That was also a very important

point, the self-esteem reinforcement. Again, this may work for others or not.

The third one that came in time was the question of visibility. We know who we are and we are very happy with knowing who we are, but what about the rest of the world? We may be invisible. In political terms as we don't have a physical border on the political maps, we are perfectly invisible. So that's okay, but we need to be visible for different things. Cities know how important it is to be visible in organizing things like exhibitions, fairs, whatever that puts them on the map of the [world] activities. For cultures, it's probably also the same.

I always explain the story that an Australian ICANN friend told me once and he was completely right. He said, "Look, Amadeu, the world is divided in two halves, not symmetrical. The largest part of that is when you say that you're Catalan, they will say, 'Oh, is that near Argentina?' The other half will say, 'Oh, no, please don't explain me again. I already met a Catalan 20 years ago.'" So we have to explain ourselves because we are not visible.

Now visibility is important, and it was at the end something that is not we want to be ourselves and identify ourselves. It's that we want to promote our self-esteem. Also, we want others to see that there is a [inaudible] in the Internet, a group of people that do things around this idea. And indeed when we did that, we said we'll see what will happen next. Indeed what happened next is that other linguistic and cultural communities said we also want and need a TLD. We want to promote our language. We want to show that it's at top-level. We want to

promote the use of our language [on the Internet]. We want to make our culture more visible – .eus, .gal, .scot, .quebec, .frl, .bzh – many things like that.

But also, other people said, “Wait. There are other ways to represent that.” So indeed if beyond the passport and the credit card may be the dictionary, may be other things. The first was Dirk coming to ICANN meetings saying, “Could this be for cities? Because I am from Berlin. Ich bin Berliner, and I want a .berlin.” And indeed it was a very good idea. You have the same thing. You want to identify yourself as being from Berlin or offer your services to that community because you want to address a concrete community through that domain name. You may want to promote things that are of specific interest for the Berliners. And also, you want to show that Berlin’s [inaudible] and this is a very good identifier. So the same criteria with different level of priorities and with similar reasoning but the same criteria applied to that.

Therefore, .berlin project was launched and from that point on, you know the story. The story is that when we had the 2012 round, you had many cities – 60 or 70-something. It’s not easy to count because some of them used the name or have the – for instance, Barcelona applied for .barcelona and .bcn which is an abbreviation. It’s not exactly a geographic name, but they also wanted to protect this. Usually they use this brand often even if it’s not the official name of the city. So you have cities or variations of cities. Some you have regions. You have subcontinents and continents, like Africa as the next speaker will explain.

We have things that are in between. You have a .quebec that's both a linguistic and cultural community and a geographic TLD and a regional TLD. So it's many different things at the same time. Some of them are directly managed by public administrations. Some of them are managed by or applied for [by] private entities or a consortium in connection with a public administration. Some others just have the blessing of the public administration. All the cultural and linguistic TLDs and some others are private civil society initiatives.

You may have the models, you have diversity today here, both in the scale of the TLD, the priorities of the TLD, and the governance model. But remember the most important thing is not whether there is an open window or not. The most important is not whether ICANN is charging you \$185,000 for the review (which is crazy) or €1. The most important thing is what you want to do with that TLD. What kind of purpose you want to do for that. This is the first, second, third, fourth question you need to answer. If you have some clear ideas about that, your TLD will be a success. And the rest of the day, you will be seeing successes and some difficulties. Some the difficulties are that launching a TLD in 2005, 2006, or 2000 was indeed much easier than in 2014.

Okay, thanks a lot. And with that, we'll go to the next speaker.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE:

Thank you, Amadeu. Our next speaker, it's a challenge for me to say your surname. Sorry for this. Is Dirk Krischenowski.

DIRK KRISCHENOWSKI: Dirk .berlin.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Yeah, Dirk. He's the senior services manager to ICANN. He will talk about success history.

DIRK KRISCHENOWSKI: Yeah, thank you very much. We're waiting for the presentation, but I'm the Dirk Amadeu mentioned two minutes ago being at my first ICANN meeting in 2005 inspired by the Catalans. If they have their language and culture TLD, we thought that cities which are much larger than some countries which have their own top-level domain, they should have a top-level domain too. We thought there are no technical whatsoever hurdles before us, but it took us at the end from 2004 until 2012 and 2014 we were finally in the root and earned money. So we had ten years preparation time for the whole one, and that was a long process. But you see today we have a process – 2012 was the last application round, and we are running into the ten years again to prepare a new round for a top-level domain name.

But that's not my topic today. My topic is the topic of the geo top-level domain group we all here founded. So you must imagine in 2005 we were sitting together with two, three, four people having the idea of a city or a regional top-level domain name. And that group was growing year by year. We were meeting at every ICANN meeting in the ten years, and the group grew up to I would say 40 people even in 2010 when the application window was far away.

From this point, at this time we tried to become a member in the ICANN community, but ICANN didn't accept us as a stakeholder group like the business community or the intellectual property community or other groups that are accredited with ICANN. It took us another four years to 2016 before we got accredited. It took us to 2016 to finally get the possibility to become an accredited group within the ICANN community. As most of the geographic top-level domain names are in Europe, we founded an international association based in Brussels, which is also in the transparency register and has access to the European Union then.

This professionalized our work and our group connection to each other and our voice at ICANN, which before was strong but even is getting stronger, especially if you have discussions like the general data protection regulation which has become an important part in the ICANN meetings. We delivered some really important pieces to this as a group. We did some group work on these things already two years before the regulation came in effect.

Okay, we need to start the presentation I think. Okay, I think we can run with this. So please, the first slide. Yeah, so our mission of that group is the promotion of the local digital identities for cities, regions, languages and cultures on the Internet. I think that covers all cities, all regions. So the Catalans are emerging from the Catalan regions, but you have groups that emerged from other places but being a language community or a culture community having gone outside their area by war or through other things. That is our mission.

And our vision for the future is that the geographic top-level domain names are shaping tomorrow's Internet and creating digital identities for places and communities. We believe strongly in that digital identity. Next slide, please.

That's the people. Most of the people you see here are also in the room. We are a quite lively and strong group here from all over the world. Next slide, please.

Next slide are the organizations behind. We have 26 organizations representing 37 different geographical top-level domain names. So we have private companies, associations, foundations, city, regional, and national governments, only to name some governments here which are owning a top-level domain name and running that top-level domain as their digital identity for their place. Next slide, please.

We are really diverse. It goes from when you start from New York, you can go via Paris and Tokyo to Sydney and back to Johannesburg and [inaudible], so our members are really spread worldwide. And the top-level domains with them, that's quite a diversity in the namespace also. Not only from language, culture, but also from the part of the world where we are coming from. Next slide, please.

These are the colorful pictures of our members here. There are some more geographical top-level domain names which are not members yet, but we hope that they will become members because our group is really looking for promoting our interests toward ICANN but also toward international organizations like EUROCITIES and other city organizations. That they become aware of the chances which new

geographic top-level domain names might create for them. We have at the moment as Amadeu said about 66 geographic top-level domain names as ICANN defines them. This is only a fraction of what may come in the future. And we are a good example for all the people from all the regions and cities which come beyond us. Next slide.

An important part of our daily work is not only the general data protection thing where we did some recent survey. I presented in a meeting before here. We are doing also our internal things to measure what is really success of a geographic top-level domain name. And as we are not in competition toward each other like .com and .net are, we can speak open and share best practice and really look at what are the criteria why this is running good and this is not running good in this city or in that region and why are language top-level domain names more successful because maybe they have more identity coming with them as regional ones. So that's really interesting. So we are looking into these success factors, and there's a number of key performance indicators which our group was coming up, and we're still working on a final set of these parameters. So please, the next slide.

The first parameter is the economic health of the TLD. Everybody is asking you how many domains do you have under .barcelona or under .cat or under .london. That's the first number that people are asking for. But this number is not the whole truth because you need to run a top-level domain name that costs about a half a million to over a million dollars a year, and you need to have a sustainable operation. And even if you are a city running this, you want to have it not as a project where

you every year give a million in it and you can't count the outcome in numbers very good.

So what we see is that high prices of domain names in the geographic top-level domain names comes with trust and stickiness while low prices often come with spam and fraud. That's not only in the geographic ones. That's also in the general top-level domain names. We have a lot of discussion there with all the other top-level domain names. Next slide, please.

And you can look, for example, on this bell curve or the Gauss curve. If you look at this, you have for example the .swiss. They are selling their top-level domain name for about \$100 U.S. or more to the public or to the registrars. They have 15,000 domains and they have an income of \$1.5 million a year. I would say they are a bit ahead of that Gauss curve. That can be discussed. In Berlin we have one-third of the price. We have 55,000. We have the same income like them. If you are an economist, what would you do? Would you increase the price or decrease the price? What can you do and where are you in that curve? These are interesting things to share in our group. For instance, .cologne has really some potential. Just \$7 at the moment and 25,000 domain names, so that can grow in that part of the curve, I would say. So next slide.

Another key performance indicator and success factor is the number of active domain names. You don't want to have a namespace where you have 90% of the domain names is a sign "I'm for sale" or there's nothing on it. You want to have the most number of your domain names that are really used for unique content, unique projects. Active domain

names, 73% is a good number. Some geo top-level domain names reach that level, and also some have only 38% in this sense. Next slide, please.

Another key performance indicator easy to do is the site search at Google. Just type in site and then [inaudible], for example, .boston and you get a result that says under all the .boston domain names that are there are 9,360 websites. So unique HTML sites you can say, so websites. And .boston has about 20,000 domain names. Next slide, please.

If you compare now .cat, they have 100,000 domain names and there are 655,000,000 websites under .cat. It's unbelievable. So that's a strong use of a geographic top-level domain name and that's one very good key parameter which shows the activity in the top-level domain names. Next slide, please.

KPI four is to be how many domain names do you have in Alexa's top mission. Alexa is not the Alexa box, but it's also an Amazon company. And Alexa is the ranking of websites in the world. You can imagine that Google, Facebook, Wikipedia, [Tencent], and [Baidu] and so on are in the top ten of that one million. They are looking for search traffic, popularity, engagement of people being how long on the site, and visitors. We're just looking on the plain numbers. For instance here, .nyc they have an outlier .nyc which is only in place 50,000 of one of the million most important, most frequently visited websites in the world. That's one parameter.

The next one, domain names per inhabitant. You can imagine that this is a good parameter. Interestingly, you can see here in the right side you see London, New York, and Tokyo, mega metropolises with 20 million or more domain names. And they have just seven, eight, or nine domain names per 1,000 inhabitants. You can imagine there's potential to grow for these. And we have some hidden champions I would say like Amsterdam here and Cologne is one, Vegas, Brussels which has a three or four times higher number of penetration of domain names in businesses and in people. That's another criteria on here. Next slide, please.

Then one a little bit harder to explain is in a place with a higher gross domestic product per inhabitant, more domain names per inhabitant should be possible. So if you have a poor city and there are a lot of domain names per inhabitant, that sounds really good. And if you have a rich city and there are less domain names per 1,000 inhabitants, it's not a good sign. So you have to look at what does it mean.

For instance, in .de as a German city top-level ccTLD in .de we have Munich. It's a rich city and they have 410 domain names per 1,000. And Berlin is a relatively poor city although totally attractive to people to come to Berlin but having only 287 domain names here.

Okay then, comparison with your strongest competitor, in most geographic top-level domain names their own country code is their strongest competitor at all. And it's not in the U.S. In the U.S. people think a .com is the country code of the United States, but they have .us. So if you compare all the cities having a TLD in the U.S. with .us, Miami

has in Miami 5.6 times more domain names than .us. That's quite impressive how they made it – .us is on the market for 15 years or something like this and .miami just overrun it in Miami.

For example, Istanbul, they have reached the level of 34% of the penetration of .tr. But for instance the number of Berlin is because we have a very strong .de domain name. We reached only 6% penetration in comparison to .de. So there's much to do for us to persuade that people having .de switch to .berlin, at least the Berliners. Next slide, please.

Other but not important parameters or non-measurable parameters are the following on the next slide. Premium domain names. Every top-level domain name or nearly all top-level domain names have premium domain names which they are selling for a higher price. In most cases, the premium sales are really hidden because they are done secretly, and the buyer doesn't want to show his result that he has bought a domain name for, let's say, \$50,000 or whatever in the public. But from the prices, these numbers are not there. But every top-level domain name has some additional income, and that could be one parameter to how attractive such namespace is really in value in money.

Okay, then the public visibility of the top-level domain name. If you have something like this on the beach, that's a nice thing here. And that's also the touristic website for visiting Rio. Visit.Rio. It can't be more perfect in this sense. Next slide.

Another KPI is the advertising volume. There are no numbers you can get, at least from my knowledge, how many public advertisings and

how much money is spent on various campaigns. Maybe you have in your country or in your region somebody who could measure it like the poster for the voting campaign in New York, there was in all the tube stations all over the city. So that's a huge volume, and that could be also a key performance indicator. How much money do companies spend in public advertising with a geographic domain name? Next slide.

Then one really unmeasurable thing is the perceived presence of the top-level domain name in the public. It could be a small glass with honey. It could be a [bienvenue.paris] on the Eiffel Tower. It can't be bigger I think or something which is car size big. So that's one parameter. I like much, but you can't measure it at all.

Then we have KPIs especially for those who have language TLDs, and Amadeu already mentioned some more like the Friesland people. How much local content is there with your new geographic domain name added, and how many websites are in the language here? I think Amadeu has quite some good numbers on these things as well.

And you see on the next slide that the Basque are having their own observatory on monitoring the Basque language in their .eus top-level domain name. That's really great work to follow what does this mean for the Basque language.

So we're coming more or less to the end I think. Yeah, the last slide is the KPI digital place brand name. So the questions are there. How does a digital identity interact with the existing place brand? It's obvious that there's some commonality at least with the name and the place. And how does the geo TLD affect the vision, the mission, directions,

awareness, and the digitalization in that place? These are questions we haven't answered at all, and the work of the people running the city top-level domain name and those who own the top-level domain name is not the same. So some have more strong ties. Some have more loose ties. But we believe that the geographic top-level domain name makes something positive with the place brand.

Yeah, that was my slides. Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE:

Thank you, Dirk. Very interesting. Our next speaker is Lucky Masilela coming from South Africa [inaudible] of the [inaudible] registry Africa, the .africa with a report on .africa. Thank you.

LUCKY MASILELA:

Thank you. I think I'm going to take from Amadeu and say good morning. This is proper, you know. I'm going to talk to you about our gTLD project in South Africa and across the continent. Because we have a few hats that we wear – we keep changing our hats – and our gTLD project, the next slide, just to show you the names under our administration. We have .africa. We have .durban, which is one of the cities along the coast of the Indian Ocean in South Africa. Some of you might have been there for ICANN meetings. [We have] .capetown and .joburg. This is additional to the ccTLD we have at the second-level domain and our administration co.za. So interchangeably, we would have to change our hats [inaudible]. So in total we administer eight products: the four gTLDs and four other ccTLDs. Next slide, please.

This is just to show you the growth over the years. We launched .africa in 2017, and to date we are sitting at a number that we think has a lot of potential to go 16,000, shy of 17,000 names. And then the other three gTLDs have been launched in 2014 where the growth has almost stagnated. We think something will happen and they will equally increase in numbers over the years.

What we know or what we have seen as a trend here is that people have taken these names mainly for protection and they are not using them extensively for their trade. But the following slides will show you what is happening to the names across these gTLDs. Now as you can see, the city of Joburg has launched a web page Visit.Joburg. And if you go there, you will see all the nightlife in Joburg. Next slide, please.

Then we have another where if you have a glazing problem, then you can visit [VehicleGlass.Joburg]. And the city life, LoveTourism.Joburg. This for us worth celebrating because this is what we would like to see in the names uptake, affordable plumbing solutions. We know over the years that our co.za namespace has grown purely because of marketing initiatives.

So this equally, if you visit Durban and you need some talent development, you can visit this page. And you can get accommodation in Durban and different [linen] sites and [inaudible] tents. We like to have events in tents and etc. So these are sites in the wild. Then in Capetown, some of the in the wild. It's [inaudible].capetown. And the [inaudible] club for those who like to have casino and [inaudible] love, Capetown is a city of love and then across the wild world. And for those

who still want to be more beautiful than they are today, it's not a [breast cancer] but this is some of the beauty surgeries that are taken.

Now talking to .africa where in particular in the wild where some of the interesting things is this project. This project by Absa which is one of the largest banks across Africa, it has recently acquired Barclays. One of the things they then were considering which domain name should they adopt in launching a new brand. They went into .com. They acquired any name that had Absa across the world. When they tried to get Absa.com, it became extremely expensive. The current owner of Absa.com required excessive amount of money which they negotiated down and eventually the deal fell through. It never happened.

And the beauty of messaging is that the CEO of Absa was in a flight and picked up a magazine, and in that magazine was a story of .africa. That story of .africa was a group of people that will be traveling, going up Mount Kilimanjaro carrying the flag. And some of the team members are here who joined us in going up the mountain. And when she read this story, it was extremely appealing to her, and she flew back to South Africa and instructed her staff, marketing, other technical and said, "I want a domain name under .africa. I want to be [MariaRamos@Absa.africa] and that was at Absa.africa. And that was done. They started working on that, and this is when they were working toward launching a new logo for the capacity which that logo is the new Absa logo.

The journey of identifying .africa for us was equally appealing because it was putting us in the right map. In that case on the launch, they had 300 – what are these things that you fly at...?

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: [inaudible]

LUCKY MASILELA: Drones. Sorry. Yes, thanks. They had 300 drones flying over the city of Joburg on the night of the launch with the name .africa, Africanacity, and Absa being launched. And for us, this is a good story. It changed for a lot of business people, and suddenly throughout the country today in our [inaudible] is in high demand because Absa had to buy all the stock of [inaudible] to launch the new logo across the ATMs. So today now in South Africa Absa is known with a new concept of Africanacity, and it's one of those values that are the flipside of one would say is Ubuntu which is "I am because of you" and one of those very important values in our continent.

So Absa is one of those beautiful stories when we talk about the uptake in adopting a name. And of course, going forth across the continent, big [banks] and great innovation is coming out of the domain name .africa. People are able to trade. People are able to connect. And radio, you can now access radio across the continent easily. Our musicians are able to exchange music, their compositions. It's one of those important journeys with a domain name where it's equally used to protect and

save some species in the continent, addressing issues of immigration equally.

Where .africa is beginning to occupy that space and talking about musicians, this is what you would see across the continent. Musicians now are able to through the platform that they have built to communicate. And [inaudible] is one of the entities of the African union responsible for programs around development. Equally it's encouraging that they have also taken .africa as their domain name.

And our brand ambassador Unathi who also traveled up to Kilimanjaro kept us awake throughout the journey and she was singing as we were walking up the mountains and amazing energy this lady had. But these are the kind of things that we would like to share with you on .africa [inaudible]. I think that is the last slide. Thank you for that - .africa and the four products. Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE:

Thank you, Lucky. We have time. We have enough time to questions and debate. This will be very interesting. I first open the microphone to everyone to want to wish to make a question. If not, I have something for you too, but first you. Don't hesitate if anyone wants to ask something. No? [inaudible]?

LUCKY MASILELA:

I can add something. After our launch in 2017 of .africa, we anticipated looking for big growth. We launched at \$18, and we do have an issue of trying to achieve price harmonization across the continent and also to

make sure we bring in issues of affordability. So where we then this year have reduced out price for .africa. It is now \$12.50. It's extremely affordable, I must say. So if you are eager in adding another name to the names that you have, consider .africa. It's \$12.50, only \$12.50. [inaudible] names around \$150, so you can imagine it's quite affordable to be connected under this brand .africa. Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE:

Okay. I have one comment regarding a couple of things very interesting that Lucky said. One, I can't resist that idea that now we should have not TLD launches but TLD drone invasions. I will expect the one trying to do that.

But especially regarding the story about [Absolute Africa] [shows] something that has always been my obsession. If you want a TLD that has success stories, traditional marketing is important. But it's only the smallest part of importance. That is you try to promote the TLD as such. [If] you try to promote the registry, [nobody is] interested in that. If you only think about the pricing, you will get some results.

But to really get the best results is when people see stories about your TLD being used by things in which they are interested. Therefore, a successful launch is basically dependent on having good pioneers, on having good domain names that are attractive to people in that community with that geographic, small or large, that they can refer to, the influencer, so to speak.

That's the real battle, having 100 good domains with good content and that they reach people not through your advertising but through other sources that they trust because they are reading about or checking things, watching things in which they are interested and suddenly they see your TLD used by somebody they trust or they want to emulate. This is the best marketing by far. So investing in having the relevant things in your community adopting not just the domain but content in that domain is, again, by far the best strategy for a successful launch.

Please?

KATRIN OHLMER:

Hi. This is Katrin from .berlin, .hamburg. I have one question. Can you probably elaborate on the distribution among Africa the continent? Is there more uptake interest in the coastal countries? Do you address the people in different countries differently? That would be something I would be interested in.

LUCKY MASILELA:

This becomes very natural. We thought we would see a big uptake. Now I'm referring to the city names .joburg, .capetown, and .durban. Johannesburg is the largest economy [inaudible] in terms of GDP followed by Durban, then Capetown. But the uptake is inverse to that. Capetown has a larger uptake of domain names registration I think because it's pretty much what you would see as an [IT] city followed by Joburg under .joburg, which is more central, far away from the ocean. And .durban which is known as our spice city of South Africa becomes

third in the uptake of names. So we address the markets based on their need. We try and get the cities to compete not only on the coast, not only because of the beautiful mountain or the city of gold but how best that name can fit into a business plan, an identity of an individual business campaign. And equally that same drive goes across the continent where we are saying to the rest of the continent that it is no longer that long river that you have, river Nile, but it is how best you can project and profile that river across the world. So the language changes across the various interest groups, and it is never the same message directly. But broadly the message is the same, but the message directly changes slightly.

KATRIN OHLMER:

Thank you. And quick follow up. How about .africa? For instance, do Moroccans use it more than Namibians or is there any correlation you can talk about?

LUCKY MASILELA:

Yeah. Interesting enough, we still have countries on the continent that have one .africa domain. Under .gn and we understand equally the country is a stress or strain on the numbers. If we look at the spread, South Africa still has the highest registration.

So it's almost like you are kicking a ball. If you think of a parabola, kick a ball from one point to the next. So the first would be in South Africa. The next highest would be in Morocco. So everything in between where they are missing the ball, it's flying above their heads. So that's what it's

like. So it would be South Africa and then Morocco. Then you kick the ball from Morocco. It lands in East Africa. It's going to be Kenya and Tanzania. Following then, you kick the ball across. Then the ball would land in Nigeria. Then everything else in between there is really a slow uptake.

Now then you don't need to kick a ball. Now you have to fly from South Africa over to North America. That becomes the next big market outside of Africa. Then from North America, the next biggest market is Europe. And then you're Australasia where that becomes the next market. This is the kind of spread that we have. I think Australia has quite a large amount of South African migrants that moved many years ago. So I think this is why you would still find Australia having this sizable number of names there.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE:

Hi. I'm here the .barcelona team. I wanted to ask you .berlin or .capetown – is it working? No? Yeah? So .barcelona team in the room. We are interested to know about the different strategies related to individuals or to companies because our government cares about the reduction of the digital divide. And we were thinking about is there a different way of promoting the domains when you want to attract citizens to have the domain or attract companies.

KATRIN OHLMER:

I'm going to present some different means how we target Berliners nowadays. I think the main issue is really that although we do a lot of

marketing in Berlin, still the main message really comes through the registrar channel. So since we don't sell domain names directly to end customers, we can still make proposals to our registrar channels, so 1&1 and GoDaddy and Host Europe and the like. What to tell their potential customers and to divide that between end customers like private entities or NGOs, IGOs, public administration, and whatever companies.

But it's up to them to decide whether they follow our proposal and recommendations or whether they do what they consider most appropriate for their brand. Because at the end of the day, it's their brand combined with our brand so it's mostly up to them. As I say, I'll present an idea of what we meanwhile set up to distinguish between different current and potential target groups and how this interacts with the .berlin domain name.

DIRK KRISCHENOWSKI:

I may add that we made a market research who are all registrants in detail and we found out that 80% of the domain names are used for commercial purposes, so by entities or maybe also associations and that 80% of the people registering were male and at an age 35 to 50 and associated with small companies. Not even small medium companies but small companies, let's say, 1 to 20 people. That's a hairdresser. That's a craftsman or a writer, a design agency, something like this that were the outcome. And that is the focus on all our marketing activities too.

LUCKY MASILELA: If I might add for not only the South Africa picture, the African picture particularly for your gTLDs, gTLDs are not open to any registrar. And we have at least 500 registrars that are accredited with us. But when you look at the ICANN accredited registrars that can provision your gTLDs, there are only 12 across the continent. So you can see immediately that for 1.2 billion people you expect it to be served by only 12 registrars, which is very thin to enable to provide proper service across a continent.

So the strategy really is to open up, come up with a plan of making it easy for the non-ICANN accredited registrars to be able to provision the gTLDs like your .africa and .joburg, .capetown, and .durban. The heavy lifting will then be done by a single registrar to enable the others to onboard or become resellers and provide those gTLDs. Because to be ICANN accredited can be really onerous. It demands quite a lot of finance and technical [inaudible] which is difficult for a lot of registrars.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: I have a question maybe for Andrea. Okay, maybe.

ANDREA BECCALLI: [inaudible]

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: [I can have a question] [inaudible]. I was listening to you. It was very interesting how the domains are very important for the communities. Language. Cities. I understand [inaudible] how New York or Barcelona,

they have thousands of followers and users. But I'm thinking about the small communities. It could be very useful in a way to help small communities to promote [inaudible] problems and to help them. But maybe it's a limit of number, size, money. I don't know what is the limit. Are you working with entities like the U.N. or World Bank to help in those?

For example, recently I met the former president of Kiribati. It's an [inaudible] island in the middle of the Pacific Ocean. They will be under water in a few years, and it's I guess a lot of them. They are 100,000 people living in there. I don't know. They are kind of far to have a domain or something like that.

ANDREA BECCALLI:

Thank you. Actually, this is a very good question and it gives me the opportunity to give more background on the gTLD program at ICANN [inaudible]. One of the main criticisms of the gTLD program that we receive is the low number of applications for new gTLDs from the developing world.

Although we – when we speak about we, I'm not speaking about the ICANN staff that I'm working of as myself, but we as the ICANN community – decided the rules for this program. We did design also, the ICANN community designed also some programs to help, just to put it simply, applications for top-level domain names coming from developing countries and specific [tracks] for communities. The program wasn't that successful, and that gave us a lot of material to think and to address.

Personally, I share the same concern and the same view. I see more and more the way that the Internet is evolving that it does represent a way to preserve identities that is unique that we don't have otherwise. So there are two points here now. How to look for the next round and how to get into the next round addressing those issues.

This is very present in the current discussion. There is a working group in ICANN. We like to complicate things. It's called the working group on subsequent procedures. On how do we go toward a next opening of the top-level domain name space. This group has to tackle also this issue. Then there is a second track which is the track of what to do with more than \$200 million U.S. - \$240 million roughly - that has been accumulated thanks to the auction proceedings mechanism for assigning contested top-level domain names.

When ICANN the community designed this program, as I said, in a way we were a victim of our own success. We didn't know that so many applications would come. We didn't expect those independent auctions to happen and to increase so much the bucket of money that ICANN had to manage. But one thing that we did right was that, as ICANN is a not-for-profit organization, was to decide by the outset that anything that would be accumulated through this process wouldn't go into the ICANN budget. It wouldn't make myself as staff ultrarich. But it would be up to the community to decide what to do with this money.

So here there is another [pilot track] within ICANN. So among the 300 sessions here, there are several sessions on these two [tracks]. On how do we set the rules for the next round taking into account that if you

look at the geography of the application – I’m speaking about all, not only geographic, I’m speaking about all – developing countries were highly unrepresented. And then how do we use this money, and the discussion within that is also how do we use this money to close this gap.

And this is something that I really encourage all of you that are getting into this discussion, ICANN working groups are open to everybody. Everybody can go there and say, “I have an idea how to do that and how we can better spend this money.” To look into that and to join those two working groups.

As an Internet user, I’m totally with you. I think that’s something that the ICANN community should look into. What is the public responsibility that ICANN has also to do that? Also, if you want to move in a world where we have more than 4 billion Internet users to the next almost 4 billion Internet users, we know two things. There are not European or North American. They are not white. They don’t speak English. They don’t write with a Latin script. And they are younger than all of us here. They are 30 the maximum.

So these people if you [walk] around are not yet in this environment, and that’s the challenge for ICANN. How to bring them. So we are in the situation that we are designing the rules for someone else which is not here, so we have to put our best intentions here and consider how the evolution of the Internet is going and just simply looking at demography and geography and look at that with an analytic point of view.

So I encourage you to look into these two. Many of you [inaudible] environment are well aware of these two working groups. But sometimes these are challenges that are overlooked on how ICANN works. We think we only do the technical stuff and ensure the DNS is resilient and it works. But there is a larger impact that ICANN has on the Internet, and this is clearly one. How to ensure that in future rounds communities, linguistic, cultural, geographic communities that so far are completely unrepresented on the Internet will be represented.

We need more. We see that already with the fairly globalization of services on top of the Internet. We all use Google search and we all go online to buy Amazon products or we all use – I don't know about you, I don't – but we use Tinder to meet our girlfriends or boyfriends or whatever. So there is this trend, but is this trend the solid one and we continue like that or will it be more a localized form of Internet integrated with that one? I would say so and I will would think that through this evolution of the DNS space there is a way to look forward.

When I was listening to the presentation for .africa I was amazed because we also tend to look at the Internet from our standpoint. In Europe, I don't know, probably almost 90% of the population is online, and that's the Internet that we see and we think that's the whole world. We have to be – two weeks ago we celebrated the day that Christopher Columbus discovered the Indies, but it actually wasn't the Indies. We have to do this kind of shift. We have to move how the Internet looks like from Africa and how African Internet users look at the Internet. Probably he has some ideas and vision that we cannot envision

ourselves because we come from a very well-framed mindset and experience.

So that's my point. ICANN has a role, yes. ICANN has the money. Not ICANN in itself. A bank is very happy to keep this money in the bank account, but the way this money is going to be spent is being decided now, so I encourage you to participate in that. Also, because you come from an experience that is very peculiar. It's an experience that is a success. The geo TLDs are among the most successful gTLDs. And you have some experiences to probably design even better rules and policies for the near future.

And if I may, I wanted to thank [inaudible], [David], and [Christina]. I didn't do it before, but now since I have the mic I will do that because with them we started discussing how we can have this session and I'm already enjoying very much this first part of the discussion. So I want to say thanks to you and to the Barcelona authorities for doing that. Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Thank you. If there are no more questions, we have one more minute for [inaudible] if you want to conclude with something for the future. Do you want to do that?

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: The future? Well, in this room the future is, Andrea, what is the next round?

ANDREA BECCALLI: [inaudible]

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Yeah, one of these days. Really, this is not any conclusion because we will discuss now after the coffee break which is the only thing that we need to stick into this ICANN meeting [inaudible] for the only coffee break that we'll have today. We will see different experiences of other TLDs and especially concrete [programs] they're doing for improving the lives of the people they try to serve in the TLD sense.

I wanted to just say something to what Consol said for the individuals. Unfortunately, the most important thing – well, unfortunately – in reality, the most important thing for individuals with a domain name is something that the registry is not in the best place to provide directly, which is e-mail. Still today when you want a domain name as an individual, what you want is an e-mail address. But as our discussion here, there are different levels. There's the registry. There's the registrar. There are ISP providers. The registry in principle just offers the domains. We all need to find ways around for the individuals to have the full package to use the domain in a way that's easier. Today it's not very easy. And cheaper. Today it's quite expensive. In order to make all this successful.

So I think now it's time for the coffee break.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: [It will be in a few minutes.]

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Wait a minute because there is a question I guess. An Internet question.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: I'm going to read the question from a remote participant. He's [John McCormack], and I think it's for .africa. Yes. "Would it be better for .africa to create an ICANN-accredited registrar to handle a new class of accredited resellers rather than relying on ICANN-accredited registrars?"

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Altogether.

LUCKY MASILELA: Okay, altogether, yes. Starting with the question, yes. We do need to create a different mechanism. This is why I said we need to create an entity that will do the heavy lifting. We have identified a company called AF Proxy which does the heavy listing. It onboards all the non-ICANN accredited registrars to come in as resellers to provision all these gTLDs. And that is one of the mechanisms that we think will bypass the ICANN accreditation route.

In closing remarks, for us what is the future? The future for us starts with looking at those countries that have zero names, zero gTLDs or zero users for registration of .africa. This is a country like South Sudan. This

is a country like Central African Republic. There are at least four countries on the continent where when you click on that there are zero registrations.

That is a concern for us. The concern cannot remain as a concern, but we need then to say how best do we bridge that gap. We think the issue that I address of the heavy lifting, making it easy, making it accessible, creating channels for registration, making it affordable, making it easy. We need also to be addressing the issue of registrars across the continent. We need to grow, provide training of registrars so that we have more than the 500 that are in South Africa or the 600 across the continent. We need more registrars to be able to provision the names.

Equally, we need more of the resellers. We need to change the mode in which domain names are accessed. The channel, the thinking must change. We need to bring in our youth. Africa is a continent [in our] population. We need to get our youth to participate in this space. They cannot be marginalized for any longer. We need to get mechanisms to bring them onboard.

And for us, finally, it's going to be the content in a language that is accessible to the people. Currently, that is one of the limiting factors besides the economy, besides the pricing, but the content out there in the Internet is still in a foreign language to a lot of the African citizens and we need to address that. That is the future that we need to be talking to. Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Just one little word. When you set up a geo TLD, a registry, you're actually setting up a part of an industry. And that push for an industry ecosystem [inaudible] the registrar that is the reseller. So there is one point where you're actually helping an industry to be created and it's a key industry. When you look how Internet grows and penetrates, you often overlook this side of it. How can you help the whole economy? Through a top-level domain name you can do quite a lot because, as I said, you become a part of the Internet infrastructure. You need some other industries to work. You need the DNS industry. To do that, you're creating knowledge. It's not only a name. It's not only an extension. There is technology. There is business besides that. That also helps community. That brings people resources, knowledge, experience and become actor of the Internet. Thank you again. It has been very good.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Thank you. Dirk? Dirk, do you want to add something?

DIRK KRISCHENOWSKI: No.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: No? Okay. Thank you very much to all of you to take part in this roundtable. I guess coffee is waiting for us. I hope you enjoyed the congress and enjoyed the city as well. Thank you very much.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Pardon. The session starts in 15 minutes – 15-minute break. Thank you.

SEBASTIEN DUCOS: Shall we start again? I'm turning to Amadeu. Can I say good afternoon now?

AMADEU ABRIL: Yes.

SEBASTIEN DUCOS: Very good. It's legal. Good afternoon. My name is Sebastien Ducos, and I am the chair of the geo TLD group, which Dirk presented a bit earlier.

For this panel, we've asked four of our TLDs to present some projects that they were running on, some innovation, some context also to show that it's not just about domain names and it's not just about the cloud and it's not just about all these things that are up there and esoteric. But we're geo TLDs also because we're attached to a land, to a culture, to a ground. We've got deep roots. A lot of the domain names that we sell are businesses that are around the corner, that are two metro stops away, that are maybe a continent away but still on the land that we walk on. So this is all about what TLDs bring to their location, to their locality, to their culture, to their language and how it interacts with real life.

Our first speaker is Beatriz Guzman from the Fundacio puntCAT, so the .cat foundation who is going to talk to us about the efforts of the foundation vis-à-vis the Catalan language and culture. Now nothing better than a Colombian presenting in English to talk about Catalan.

BEATRIZ GUZMAN:

Thanks, everybody. This is going to be short and nice, I hope. Yes, I'm from Colombia, but I've been here for more than 15 years. So I'm very proud to talk about our efforts at Fundacio puntCAT to try to promote language and culture through out community. It's more than 12 years committed to our community.

I think it's convenient to remember who we are and what is our mission. Fundacio puntCAT is a private not-for-profit organization without political affiliation which owns the .cat domain. It is self-financed exclusively through the sale of .cat domains. And we have a lot of missions, but especially two I want to remark two missions today.

The first one is to promote activity related to the creation and management of the .cat domain, and the second one is to raise the profile of the Catalan identity in the normalization of the use of Catalan in the Internet. This is very, very important to us because we don't want to be perceived just like a company to sell domains but a company or foundation that is really committed to the literacy of digital and the digitalization of our community.

It is important to know what have we done before until now, what are we doing right now, and what are we going to do from now on. Let's talk about our history. What have we done before? During the first five years of .cat, we were so excited to have a domain to represent our own culture. So we had two main goals.

First of all, we were focused on supporting community initiatives. I will talk about these initiatives. And we were especially focused on awareness of all the possibilities to live fully in Catalan on and offline. We have a community very engaged and very proud of the language. And now we have the possibility to identify this language in the Internet with a special domain. So during our first years, we did a lot of talks in the nation to schools, associations. We were co-editors of [thematic] online dictionaries. We collaborated with blogosphere.

And I want to talk especially about two lovely projects from our foundation which are Navega en Catala which means Browse in Catalan and the collaboration with Wikipedia which is [inaudible] Wikipedia in Catalan.

Navega en Catala, this is a very special project which was born with the aim to raise the awareness on the need to browse in Catalan. Why is that important? Because every time you browse in Catalan, there are two things to take into account. First of all, you are increasing demand and offer of content in our language. And on the other hand, if all the devices and browsers can identify that you are browsing in Catalan, you are able to create content for ads for marketing and things like that, that can recognize the language you are browsing in.

So it was very important for us, and we created a widget to help people to indicate browsers and devices how to change the language to browse in Catalan. This is our project, an historical project that we are going to do a revival during our next years.

Our collaboration with Wikipedia which was very nice for us because in Catalan Wikipedia has one of the most engaged communities and is always creating new content for the Wikipedia. Our help with them was trying to create [inaudible], try to establish a point of contact between schools, universities, and the staff of Wikipedia in Catalonia. This way we could collaborate from [a third] part in the creation of new content in Catalan to increase the offer of content for the whole community.

There were a lot of projects that we did in our past, but I think it's very important to talk about what are we doing right now and what are we going to do after that.

What are we doing right now? After our experience when during the first five years, we realized that we should concentrate and professionalize our efforts to do something bigger and more structured. That's why all the schools and [talks] and non-concentrated efforts [we came] together to create Webs al punt .cat. It's a competition for schools, for students between 10 and 20 years old to teach them how to create a website, whether it's a WordPress or a code website to fill this website with content in Catalan.

This year is going to be the ninth edition of this contest, and we are very proud of all the [develop] of this and how this has been growing through the time and getting better and better due to experience. Now we are proud to say that we have more than 1,000 maybe, I don't know, 100 schools or groups engaged to this contest. And we are going to expand this program not only in Catalonia but all the Catalan speaking territories. This is a seed that we are planting so when they grow up they

have content enough or knowledge enough to create a website, they should think in Catalan and in .cat.

Second one is [inaudible] which is a project to reduce the gap in digital tools. It's a [inaudible] project for NGOs so we could help them to create their presence online. All this is focused on the creation of content in Catalan for all in a [transversal] way for all the sectors of the economy. Right now, we're also part of [Catosfera] which is a kind of TED Talks in a Catalan way to think about Internet, digital tools, journalism, and all the things related to technology and Internet in Catalan, to Catalan territories and Catalan speaking people.

We're doing this right now, but we want to do more. So our next steps are related to going back to the territory. We want to go to every town in Catalan speaking territories because we as a foundation are very committed to the digital literacy of the Catalan speaking territories. So our objective is to visit every town and city in Catalan speaking territories to teach [inaudible] how to create, update, and position their first website.

How do we do that? We do that with three things especially. Through physical presence in the territory. We as a foundation have a team dedicated to travel through the territory to the Catalan speaking territories to deal with principal actors and create partnerships with them to disseminate information, to do the logistic part, to create a physical meeting to teach people physically how to create their website and presence. This is very important because we all know we're in a digital business but there are still a lot of people who need physical

support to come from the no market to the market of domains and the Internet. This is possible due to the efforts of a team that is taking care of people, supporting them during all the process to put them online for the first time.

Also, we created a unique platform to [contract] the domain, configure e-mail, and create the website in collaboration with registrars. Right now we're running a pilot program to test this platform. This way we could export this pilot program to all our registrars and to open this tool to help people in an effective way with support online and offline to support them and stay with them during all their process to feel confident with their own website.

And finally, we created a special [pack] with a special price. This is part of our foundation side but also the idea of making bigger the .cat domain. We don't want to confuse the market. It's only one price for all, for everything. The most important part of this [pack] is the company and the support that we are providing during all the process.

As I mentioned before, Navega en Catala is a project, Browse in Catalan, that we want to update to start again doing this part of this dissemination of information and awareness about the importance of browsing in your mother language. Altogether, it's going to create something called [La Comunidad Punt .CAT] which means the community from .cat. It's a project which is still under construction with the objective to do something different for the owners of the .cat domain.

A domain is a domain. It is what it is. But especially as [Sebastien] told we are part of a domain created by a community, so we want to give back to the community all of the things we have earned with the selling of the domain and with the experience of handling projects. So La Comunidad is going to be an umbrella project to put together all the owners of .cat trying to create synergy, trying to give value added, and trying to make them feel proud of being part of .cat and think that .cat is more than a domain. It's a way to think. It's a way to present your identity online. So we want to do something bigger with these people. We want to make them feel proud, and we want to make them feel engaged, and we want to create new projects coming from the needs of the community. We want to give them voice to decide and to choose projects to develop with the efforts of the foundation.

Right now, this is our focus. This is our work. We have a lot of things to do, but we are happy with our outcomes and we are looking for more things to do and to show you next time. Thank you.

SEBASTIEN DUCOS:

If you don't mind, I'd like to keep the questions at the end so we open a debate and to roll directly into the next presentation, which is going to be given by Ronald Schwarzler of .wien who is going to present again how the TLD can serve the community or the public service in the community by protecting public assets online. Ronald?

RONALD SCHWARZLER: On behalf of domainworx which is a company that runs the geo TLDs for .wien which is the German term for the city of Vienna and the geo TLDs for Cologne and Koeln which is the German term for Cologne, let me greet you. I will, together with my colleague Hartmut who is sitting next to me, he will do the Cologne/Koeln part, I will do the Vienna part, the .wien part. I will try to talk to you about the, not problems, but the considerations or the challenges we had to face or we were facing when starting up our TLDs.

We are a private company that runs the city TLD, the TLD .wien, on our own business risks and our own costs and our own income. But as you know, the Applicant Guidebook 2012 stated very clearly if you are running a TLD under a geographic term, you have to have a support letter from the city. So you're not just allowed to say, "I'm going to do .madrid or .sevilla or whatever city. You have to have the support letter or at least a letter of non-objection from the city.

And when you as a private company or when we as a private company approach the city, [inaudible] you have to sign us something. At least in Germany or in Austria, nothing is for free. If you want something, you have to give something. If you want the signature for being able to operate to run a TLD, it's normal or it's expected that the city says, "Yeah, it's okay. I trust you. But I want some of the typical domain names that, let me say, belong to the city."

This doesn't sound astonishing: mayor.london, metro.paris, police.london or police.nyc. These are domain names that obviously are part of the public interest of the city. As you probably know, police,

there is a band called Police which is a trademark, there is the sunglasses company which has a trademark in the Trademark Clearinghouse, and there is the police looking for our security, etc. in a city or the Metro in Paris, the underground. There is a German company named Metro.

If you look at the ICANN provisions for starting up a TLD, there is the first 30 or 60 days period where only those who have trademarks registered in the Trademark Clearinghouse that are allowed to register such domain names. So following the straightforward path would result in mayor.paris refer probably to a Havana cigar because there is a brand Mayor which is [inaudible] would result in sunglasses representing the mayor's office of .london or metro.paris the German company and not the underground of Paris that everybody of the targeted audience would expect it to be.

So following that, we had to find ways. And it's not about gaming the system. Please, I don't tell you how you can game the system in certain positions and go around Trademark Clearinghouse rights and rights of brands and whatever. But I think it's one of the most critical things if you start up a TLD that the domains that are typical for the city remain with the city.

Before I start introducing what I really mean, I'll give you one example not about a trademark but on a commercial offer. In Vienna, we have one large or medium sized airport, and 50 kilometers next to Vienna there is Bratislava. The airport of Bratislava wanted to have airport.wien. They offered a lot of money for that domain name. It's a

premium domain name. As a CEO of that company said, “Oh, I’d like to have this.” It was a five-digit number.

But it would have been the wrong decision to give the airport.wien domain to the city or the airport of Bratislava because the people going to airport.wien expect an airport in Vienna to see when the flights are going out and the flights are coming in. They are not interested that I take a decision to take something-thousand euros to finance my employees or whatever. They want the best information under that typical domain name. This is the same for the police. This is the same for the mayor. This is the same for Metro or underground in your existing TLD. Next slide, please.

So why did we decide to do a geo TLD regardless of whether it’s Cologne, Berlin, Hamburg? You’ve heard a lot of arguments about that. just to bring them up again, it’s about city branding. I think the city of Vienna, the city of Berlin, the city of Cologne, it’s much about being a brand on its own. Vienna is very well-known for tourism, and the brand of Vienna, .wien, is spread worldwide. So having their own TLD is really important, although the city does not yet use it consistently.

Independency of existing ccTLDs, yeah, Vienna is located in Austria. It’s very clear that you have to have wien.at or something. But there are other, let me call them, yeah, close to fake sites. For example, community/wien.at. If you run your own TLD, you can somehow control that all these terms that are somehow related to the public authority of .wien are just given to the city and not to someone who wants to attract visitors and somehow pretend that they are city officials.

The city of Vienna faced four or five legal cases of trying to bring such websites down because they pretended to give official city information over the past 10-15 years. Having their own TLD, they could set up their own policies to say anyone who is close to bringing up the notion of being close to the city, we are allowed to shut down, redelegate, or however.

The next point, availability of significant expressions [weren't] already existing or registered in existing TLDs. Building up your own city TLD you have the chance to start from scratch: tourism.wien, city.wien. Whatever you like is available at the point of starting your TLD. When the city of Wien, and I think any city in the world or close to any city, was aware that there is an Internet out there that you can register domain names, a high percentage of the very good names were already taken. City of Wien started their Internet presence, if I'm informed correctly, 15 years before which was in the year of 2003. At that point of time, I think 300,000 up to 400,000 domain names under .at were already registered.

So starting your own city TLD could and should give the possibility to start from scratch to plan your presence and build up the trust in the city websites. This is more or less the reason why a city TLD should run it, regardless whether the city runs it on their own behalf, runs it in a corporation with another company. Or say, "You are a private company. Run the business, but please remember we have a reputation to lose. You have to do it correctly. We want to have set up a domain name council or something like that." We have regular meeting with the city officials talking about development, judging whether we are, not behaving well, but operating well and such things. Next slide, please.

So let me give you two approaches of official city websites that we are currently facing. The first one is the city of Wien, Vienna. It's underway to decide that they will use very few terms like gov.wien, city.wien – the German term will be stadt.wien – and tourism.wien and have third-level domain names before that. So they will not use thousands of domain names, but to say we are focusing on gov.wien. And under this, all the city affiliated sites would be placed. It's a very close approach to giving weight to the one domain name or the very few domain names that a city will be using and they will spread them on all their advertisements and whatever. This is what we are talking about. It's not in reality yet. It's not about 500 or 1,000 or whatever domains. These third-level domains, tv.wien was not even possible to register when the program started. It was one of these two-character things. It's now possible. This is why they are rethinking their strategy toward using the .wien top-level domain.

HARTMUT SCHULZ:

Next slide, please. Good afternoon. My name is Hartmut. I'm working for domainworx in Vienna, but I come from Cologne. Until half a year ago I lived there, and I've been working for and with the TLD .koeln and .cologne since it's on the market.

I just want to give a brief overview how the city of Cologne came to the decision of acting [how it acts at the moment]. First, the legal situation. The city of Cologne really stuck to the legal situation it had found. There are three – it's very technical there – but basically you can say a city name is like a private name. It's protected by private name law. So

that's basically a very strong law. Nevertheless, there's one restriction. You will only be able to refer to these rights you have if it's for economic reasons, not for private reasons.

That's the restriction that a city has and under North Rhine-Westphalian law – Cologne is a city in North Rhine-Westphalia in Germany – you are not allowed to give...you have to treat your name as a brand more or less which officially it isn't but you're not allowed to allow anyone to use your name without with taking money for it. So as a registry, as a private registry, you have to pay a license to the city of Cologne. That's what we did.

But for the registrars, there are no limitations at all. For the registrants, sorry. If you have a private name, if you have a bar, if you have a restaurant, nobody can deny you using a .koeln domain. So it's a very open domain. There are hardly any restrictions. Next slide, please.

The city of Cologne took a totally different approach to the way they want to show themselves on the Internet than Vienna. The idea of Cologne was we want to have a good domain name for our inhabitants. That's why it's cheap, not because we wanted to promote fraud but because the city said it has to be cheap so that everyone in the town can afford his own .koeln or .cologne domain.

On the other hand, the city of Cologne said we want to use it for our city marketing and we want to promote the name of the city of Cologne on the Internet, which means we as a city need a lot of domains to promote our business. And that's kind of difficult because, as you can see, there is one limitation. You can only reserve or register domains if you are an

official entity under North Rhine-Westphalian law if those apply to those basic social services.

This went so far that something like the first example I gave, the archaeological preservation and care of [field] monuments is a totally valid and totally legal name for the city of Cologne. A generic term like `wirtschaft.koeln` (economics.koeln) which is very interesting for the city was not reserved for the city. They had to buy it after the Sunrise period and after the legal claims period because they had no real title to use it. Under law, there was no way for them.

Nevertheless, they found 1,600 domain names which they use for themselves. We are going to redirect them to the city, but meanwhile they even use around about 250 of them, which is quite a lot. And we see that the numbers on the Internet really increase the more they use them, the more they introduce them, the number of calls on the Internet for `.koeln` and so on really increase. So that's working fairly well.

And it had some there, those around about 250 domains in [inaudible].koeln. The city of Cologne, of course, was one which we reserved to them and which they used from the start. Museums too. Bildung (education) also. But, for instance, the last one, park – a park can be run by a city, it can be run by a private person. However, they really bought that one.

Nevertheless, they use it. And until, I think, end of next year probably it will be two years later, the city will use all of those domains that they reserved and will go away from the `stadt-koeln.de` they have been using

so far and switch their whole system. So a totally different approach to Vienna where they had three domains using the .wien for local government. We are going to have around about 1,000 domains used by the city itself for its local affairs. Okay, the next slide please.

The next slide is only some examples of how they promote it at the moment. All those three are examples from really official departments of the city. The orange one, [theater].cologne is rather obvious. That's the local theater run by the city. Visit.koeln is the local Cologne tourism board. And you can't really read it, but on the left side the website is KVB, Kölner Verkehrs-Betriebe, which is our local transportation company which belongs to the city itself. So they're really promoting it, they're using it, and as you can see all of them are different designs and address different people in the city and beyond. So totally different than Vienna. And I hand back to Ronald.

RONALD SCHWARZLER: Next slide, please. How could we make sure that the city, either the 3 names or the 1,000 names, were really finally delegated to the city? You all remember the registry is allowed to put names on a reserved list. They must not be earmarked. So putting a name like, let's say, mayor on a reserved list until I will give it to the city of Vienna because it belongs to the mayor or whatever is not allowed.

So we had to find – and again, I'm not talking about gaming the system – but as Hartmut told there are some provisions under the applicable law that the city is allowed to register even trademarks for the city. And the other thing is we in Vienna, and similar in Cologne, we introduced a

special let's say limited Sunrise period or delegation period where we said these will be the names of public interest. So we defined a category: names of public interest. And at least due to Austrian law there is a very clear definition which organization, which company, which not-for-profit organization or whatever acts in the public interest.

So we invited all these public companies, organizations acting due to Austrian law in the public interest to send us to propose domain names that should be set on this reserved list. Again, this is not earmarking to one special company or to one special person. It's about reserving names of the public interest to a later delegation period. So it's about cherry picking, word picking, or however.

But this is a means that worked and, for sure, some of these public interest organizations send us, "I want to have shop.wien." There was a domain name council, a board of seven people, really looking at any single proposed name and said, "Okay, this is a nice to have word, but it's not in the public interest." So we eliminated words from the public interest reserve list. They did not run through Sunrise. They did not run through whatever limited registration period that was starting or going through before open registration.

Then at some point of time we took these, it was about 300 to 400 names and went through name-by-name. So mayor.wien. It is on the list. Who has applied or proposed this name? Okay, it was only the city of Vienna who had applied for that name, so it was not a real bad guess who will finally get it in the official delegation. Then, for example,

economics (wirtschaft.wien) had been applied for by the city and by the wirtschaft, the economic business whatever it is called in English.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Chamber of Commerce.

RONALD SCHWARZLER: Exactly, the Chamber of Commerce. So this was some kind of – yeah, we had a policy. We had to do a policy because it was a special delegation phase. There was a clear measure of how to resolve conflicts. And finally it did not end up in an auction, but it could have ended up in an auction. If they had not agreed on who to use it, then it would have ended up in an auction. Like, for example, in [inaudible] Sunrise when there were two [mark holders] these domain names would have been auctions. Even between the public interest companies, organizations we had to do such a policy. And finally it was not decided by auction. It was first looked at by experts on mediation, and then we agreed on it. So the public interest companies did not have to spend money with us like, for example, ICANN gets with the auction proceeding funds.

The real problem – and this was not the setting up of this blue extra phase or the policies – the problem was talking to organizations five, six months before they even knew that there will be a TLD for the city. So you had to go to the mayor’s office. You had to go to the Chamber of Commerce office. You had to go to the health care offices. Explain to them what is a TLD, what is the new namespace. Do you propose some

of these names? Explain to them why they should get it, how they could get it. So talking about something that is not in operation at the point of time that you are talking to them. We did not even know when we would go into operation because at that point of time the rights protection mechanisms and whatever were not already in place.

And even today at some point of time I get a phone call, I get an e-mail, “If you had told me four years before that I should have gotten this name, I would have tried to reserve that.” Okay, you’re four years late. So whenever you plan to do a new city TLD, a new regional geo TLD or whatever, there are means to at least not guarantee but a high probability to get the names that the authority that stands behind this geo TLD is able to get the most important names. It’s a lot of work, especially in convincing and talking to people before it is in operation. Once it is in operation, once there is an open delegation, a channel of availability, you’re too late with our approach. You must act before. This is the real challenge that you have to be that early and people not recognizing what they have. It could be easier at that time when we have the next round because you can show example of .berlin, you can show examples of .paris, of .wien, of .cologne. But at that point of time talking in 2012 about reserving names, most of them didn’t have a clue on that. I think this is the last slide. Can we finish?

I really urge you and tell you a geo TLD is worth doing the work you have to do for it. It’s hard work. We observe that it’s at least a trend in [small] Austria to operate the city TLD as a brand. I think Vienna is one city in Vienna that has 2 million people. The next largest city has 200,000

inhabitants. I can barely imagine that there will be enough registrations to cover the expenses for this TLD.

So the city councils that I am talking to are really thinking about operating the city TLD as a brand: .linz, .graz, .salzburg. This is a brand. Salzburg is a worldwide brand, and they can decide whether they give a .salzburg domain name to a five-star hotel or whatever you want to give to, not relying on selling domain names [inaudible] somehow the costs should be covered by selling 10,000 or 20,000 or even 50,000 domain names. This is a trend we see at least in Austria. Tourism, various cities, regions operating their TLD as a brand to be a spot on the worldwide Internet.

Thank you for your attention.

SEBASTIEN DUCOS:

Thank you, Ronald and Hartmut. Next up is Katrin Ohlmer of .berlin who is going to talk about the efforts that they're doing in .berlin in aligning the products and services that they have with the local population and their needs. Once again, the motto: it's not about domain names.

KATRIN OHLMER:

Thanks, Sebastien. This is right. We found over the last couple of years that a domain name is a domain name and that's okay for the time being, but still there's much more where customers can align with what the companies behind that.

So I call this making our .berlin values more accessible. So let me tell you where we come from. The public perception of a domain name is still about the numbers and sometimes about testimonials but mainly I think we heard that today. So the first question is always about how many domain names are in .berlin, .cologne, .whatever.

I think this perception neglects that there are values of the company, values of the product and usually values of the owner of a domain name which should align with each other. So if you buy Mercedes Benz, you share the same values between Mercedes and yourself to a certain degree. The same should apply, in our opinion, with the product we sell. We had that earlier on that the sales channel is not really working that way. So it's out duty to determine how we can align our values with the values of the right amount of customers.

So .berlin is not for all Berliners. It's dedicated to all Berliners, but it's still for a certain amount of Berliners which share the same values we have. These values are mainly about identity and giving people a digital home. What we see is a pretty big contrast to when you are on registrar websites. It's mostly about technical features and sometimes about pricings, and then you have this blinking premium price or better price or whatever. So there's no value based communication which the sales channel does.

So we asked ourselves how do we find a better way apart from the domains to communicate your values to the market. What we did is in the first step define what we want. As told, we want to communicate our values on a level which is different to what others did before, which

are more about people can follow which are sweet and short and easy to understand and not on whatever technical identifier level. To add more dimensions to what we offer because at that time we had the domains we sold. We also had some premium names. We had a shop and resellers, so we had quite some outlets where people could get used to what we do. But we felt that this is still not the right place where we could communicate more and get more of this local identity out to people.

We also felt that the communication opportunities are not enough and not probably the right we were able to make use of in the past. For instance, if you celebrate your third or fourth or fifth birthday of the TLD, it's about numbers again and it's about do you have great success stories. And it's more about mechanics and less about the value those kind of products bring to people. We also wanted to have more opportunities to communicate what we think is by [inaudible] the thing we want to communicate.

Also, we wanted to let Berliners communicate and experience .berlin more easily and for free. This interacts with what Amadeu mentioned earlier. This e-mail service is then the result we came up with. And another side effect is nowadays to increase the awareness of .berlin among people who don't have a domain name but have some interest in a digital product.

So what we did is then we launched mail.berlin end of May, and it comes in three flavors. So this is just looks – if you check mail.berlin, you get on this website. This is how it looks like. It comes in three

flavors. The first one is really the one which is the main focus for us. It's a free e-mail service we offer to all Berliners.

Of course, there are some names blocked, although it's legally not [amicable] names. We did not want to have that in the zone, so we made a list of names before the ad which you can't have. But else, you're free to get your first name, your last name, whatever nickname you want. So we thought on the one hand it's a good way of communicating with people. It's also the first step of getting used to a digital identity not on the Internet really but while you use the Internet for communication purposes. It's free. We think we also like to give something back to Berlin.

And if you wish so, you can also have business.berlin – this comes with a cost – and web.berlin or a completely free choice. If you're a small business who thinks registering a domain name in order to get then three e-mail addresses is much too complicated, this is the service for these kinds of customers.

Launch wise, we focused in the first step on the shareholders of the company. We have roughly 100 shareholders in the company which vary between the city, marketing, and private persons. So there's a huge heterogenous group who are shareholders in the company. And also we shared that with friends and family, so we have a pretty big newsletter where we announced that pre-public opening. Then we did the public opening.

It was a pretty interesting marketing and communication result. We just sent out one press release to the public saying that e-mail addresses

with the ending of .berlin are available for everybody. And this everybody was really important for us because it says it's a democratic product. It doesn't come with any barriers, and you can have that for free and it's for everyone. This resulted in over 40 press clippings, including some radio and TV appearances. And even the national newspaper reported about that.

And the media headlines then included the digital home for all Berliners, which is exactly what we were aiming at, to push it that way and give people a very neat and straightforward way to experience what we think .berlin is also about. Yes, it's also about getting a website with .berlin, but it's much more than just that. We're in the process of doing much more in that direction, but I wanted to give you just a small glimpse of what we do here.

In the meantime, we let them experience how to use their .berlin e-mail home and we broadened the awareness for .berlin and the values which stand behind the company and the product a lot, meaning that we have much younger people interact with us. We have a lot of interest from groups we haven't seen before, which is great and which are probably not that close to getting a website done and knowing what a content management system is and all that which is associated with website, all this technical stuff.

The next step will be we will just implement new features. The ones customers gave back to us and said, "Wouldn't it be a nice thing if we could do this and that?" So we are in the process of prioritizing the features and implementing them probably next month. Also, we

received quite a number of inquiries for corporations for certain associations and organizations. Can we do whatever .berlin mail project just for our members, partners, whoever? So we're working on that. This will probably be a bit more demanding because we have to integrate that in our process and they have to integrate it. But at least those are the next steps.

With this, I am at the end. Any questions? I'm supposed to take them later if there are any.

SEBASTIEN DUCOS:

Let's keep on. Yeah, [inaudible] we'll take the questions at the end. Thank you very much, Katrin, and thank you very much for wrapping this quickly.

I don't know how to introduce the next project. In French when you have an idea that's out of left field, you say sud-ouest. And westward, we've got Brittany who is coming with a completely different project that I said it's not all about domains. This one is very specifically not about domains at all and not about DNS at all either.

MATTHIEU CREDOU:

Thank you, Sebastien. Hello, everyone. I'm Matthieu from .bzh. Yes, so we will talk about something completely different from domain names. I will shorten my presentation. There was another topic about domain names, but I don't think we have time for that.

The project I will talk about is coming from domain names in a way and is proof that it's useful for a regional TLD, for geographic TLDs are a useful asset for a city or a region.

Just a brief summary of where we come from. We started back in 2006 and we launched in 2014, and we have 8,000 domains under management. But this is not domain point. Basically, this is where I live. This is another issue, but I don't think we have time to cover that today.

Anyway, our main topic today is emojis, and not emojis in domain names. But this was actually the start of our project. Last year we were looking into these very cool things but not standard URLs involving emojis, mixing up emojis and domain names. We soon realized that it was not allowed by ICANN standards, but we discovered a specific project that felt very close to home which was the proposal for the Breton flag emoji.

This project was some very familiar to us. Our purpose, as Amadeu said you need a purpose, our purpose is to provide the Breton community with tools to promote their digital identity. In the new world of mobile communications, emojis are so important today. We said, "Well, that's something a bit like a .bzh that's another marker of our regional identity online. So that's something that sounds familiar to us.

Then we looked into it and there is another organization, not ICANN, but this time it's Unicode and it's a California based organization and everybody speaks English and everybody is American basically. So we said, "Well, we know about that. We've seen that somewhere before. So, okay, let's look into this."

The same as happened as with .cat who first launched a sponsored TLD at the time, here we have England, Scotland, and Wales who managed to get their emojis into the system thanks to a technical note the equivalent of the new round of TLDs. It works differently in the emoji world, but the door opened at the time back in 2017. So we thought to ourselves this is our opportunity.

The importance of having a TLD within your community that comes with a specific set of skills. Now we were able to look into this, to look through not RFCs but to look into the Unicode application process. And we knew how to tackle this, so we managed to file an application. And specifically we built a new campaign around this. So back in the day, it took us about two or three years to gather 20,000 support for the TLD project. And now within two months we managed to reach the same point.

So this operation has been a large success in terms of media and reception in the community, and it's a great opportunity to promote .bzh at the same time because we are telling people your regional identity is important and you need new means to promote it online. So there we are. Because we are a TLD, we have discovered this new opportunity. So we filed an application. Unfortunately, we got rejected last September. But we think we have a case to convince Unicode that the Breton flag is interesting to add to the list of existing flags. And we think that it will be because we have a group application.

One of the commonalities between those flags would be that we are in the root zone already. And because Unicode is asking for us to provide

some rationale because technically speaking you could add 5,000 new emojis under this specification and that's too much for the systems. But if we can say ICANN has recognized some regions, some subdivisions of countries already, that could be a big argument also to build a case around to push those emojis to Unicode.

So having a TLD now might become an asset for another venture, for another project and to help grow your community bigger and bigger again. If you have some questions about how to get in, I'm available to answer that. I don't think we have time for that necessarily. But this will be very interesting project for a few members of the geo TLD group. And I think being a TLD might, for one, be an asset to something else.

SEBASTIEN DUCOS:

Thank you very much, Matthieu. Thank you for everybody who presented. I think that we have about 25 minutes, 20 minutes until the break. We're open to questions. Please. Can you please come to the table and to the mics so our remote participants can hear you?

JOSE ALBERTO RODRIGEZ:

Thank you. Good afternoon. My name is Jose from Cuba. I'm an ICANN Fellow. My question is for all the [inaudible]. I don't know, my question is it's better when we start a project with that .cat, for example, or whatever city, it's better to start with all the service like mail or like all that kind of service or any kind of alternative or apps for the people, or is better to increase the service maybe when we saw that the dot is used

or the people accepted the platform or they accepted the offer. That's my question.

SEBASTIEN DUCOS:

Thank you. Katrin, do you want to take that one?

KATRIN OHLMER:

Thank you. I think it depends on your target group and your market to determine whether you just start with selling domain names and developing over time further offerings like you get content management system an all that stuff together later on like a bundle like Jimdo and WordPress do or if you offer the e-mail service as we do. I mean, we started in 2014 and only launched the e-mail service this year. So as with .cat, I think it's more about ripening over the years and getting used to how to communicate in the market and getting more knowledge about the customer is probably a better approach.

And I felt totally the same with .cat as we were. So we were really excited in the first years and did a lot here and there. And over time you kind of get settled and then determine, "Okay, so this is the set of activities we do and from here what's our overall strategy?" So this first [inaudible] is probably I would recommend that and go from there to determine what the needs of your clients are.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE:

If I can add some too, I'd say that just like any business you need to watch what your product is and how much effort you can put in so many

different things. You need to keep focus. We're not selling domains to people. We're selling domains through registrars who they themselves may have products and services to offer, which is great. And you want to make sure that whatever you're bringing to the table is something they're not already selling, you're not stepping on their toes, and that provides something new for your clients.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Hello. I'm [Else] from the city of Ghent in Belgium. We heard some presentations on companies working together at municipalities: Berlin, Koeln, Vienna. But can you give the ultimate tip how a city council should behave or what their position should be to make the domain name a success seen from the company point of view?

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Sorry. I'm going to [flog] my wares for a second.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: In one line.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: In one line?

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: I can answer it in one line.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: In one line: I have none. There's no secret sauce. But partake in the discussions of the geo TLD group because that's exactly the sauce that we're trying to create. That's exactly what we're trying to share. So become a member.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: I can add something. Just use it. Use the domain names.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: And I can add something else. Define success. For instance, .barcelona has gone since the inception of the process through three different administrations from three different parties that have three different main purposes. So success may be defined in different ways depending on what you try to do. That is, for some cities, for some administrations the external promotion is the most important thing. For others, providing new services to the individuals is the most important thing. For other ones, promoting the economy is the most important thing. So the measure of success will depend on what's the main goal that the city has in regard to the TLD. So there is no one single recipe, I'm afraid.

SEBASTIEN DUCOS: Thank you. Dirk, you wanted to?

DIRK KRISCHENOWSKI: Yeah, Dirk Krischenowski from .berlin. As you are using already [stadt.gent] also on public communication, just not only this address but also culture.gent and arts.gent or hotels.gent or what you want to

promote or visit.gent would be nice addresses to be used and seen in the public. Because then everybody can see that it's used, and citizens and the businesses think, "Okay, if the government is using this, it's safe, it's good, and I can use it too." So that would be – all the public campaigns you're doing, all the brochures where web addresses are on there should be a .gent web address.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE:

There's another thing that we need to factor in which is the engagement with the sales distribution, which is the registrars. And usually, these are two different worlds that are very hard to combine because you come on one end from the institutional level that is used to a certain way of doing things and on the other which is a registrar that has to live in a very competitive environment and has to be given motivations to push for your product. Because for them it's a product. For them, of course, they may have sympathies about what you do or where you are if they are local registrars, but they cannot justify getting involved if they don't see reasonable benefits in your product.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE:

Another example of defining success, I was approached by a region in Austria who tends to apply for cultural capital, let's say, 20, 28, or something. They say, "We want our own identity. We want to have our own TLD." They are not measuring the success of the TLD. They are measuring the value of their communications when applying for the cultural capital of Europe, thereby also contributing or distributing their mark, their brand. And probably the success will be how many

tourists are visiting and getting to know our region for the next 5, 10, 20 years or so. To them, that is such a huge project. That's a huge spending of money. The costs for the TLD are really neglectable. It's to have a good means of communicating your brand to the, let's say, European public. So you can't measure it with – and I think they will not even sell 1,000 domain names. They will only have this one 10, 15, 20 domain names dedicated to their city, to their region, and to the activities that are done in this cultural capital thing.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE:

Sorry. And finally else, people need the most relevant things that are related to Ghent to appear under .gent. So you have university.gent, you have market.gent with all the bars and shops that are in that nice square. You have the local breweries with .gent. You have the stad.gent, the [castle], etc. These [inaudible] other people coming. So not just the testimonials but the spillover effect of having the most relevant things, the most visited sites in your town for your people using .gent, this is what also will make success in terms of number and spread if that is a success measure, which is one of them.

SEBASTIEN DUCOS:

Okay, thank you. I think that we need to wrap up. I'm getting a lot of fingers being [inaudible] like that.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE:

[I do have a question.]

SEBASTIEN DUCOS: Ah, you have a question. Sorry.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: [inaudible] I have a question to all of you that presented. It's a pity that .madrid is not here because I know that I have been [living] through that. They were here earlier. They were here. I saw them. Okay, some water please to the [inaudible]. My question is, how do you manage your relationship with the local authorities? How do you manage the ebbs and flows or the ups and downs. In this case, the left and right of local authorities coming and going. And whether you have a magic formula or not or whether you are looking to the [city TLD] as a model to get yourself through this. Because I think it plays a good role into the success or not of a geo TLD, in this case a city TLD.

And then I love the idea of the e-mail. I was thinking I would love to move from my Gmail name to something Andrea@.rome. That's my city. I think it made me really dream of that. Anyway, thanks.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: [inaudible]

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: I can change e-mail account.

RONALD SCHWARZLER: I think there is no magical formula. We in Vienna, we run it on a private basis. So our own risks, our own income, our own expenses. And we agreed with the city of Vienna to have at least a yearly, if not biweekly, meeting with the domain name council which our three representatives of the city are in. But we don't talk about how we price premium domain names. That's up to us. But the city says, you focus too much on, let's say, red light domain names when you do your advertisement or whatever. We never had that complaint, by the way. But it's about being responsible to the city, being responsive to the city, and keeping an eye on not destroying – no, the other way around – building up the reputation for the city even on the Internet. But that's probably we are relatively far away from the city because it's our own private thing how to run the TLD as long as we do not disturb their purposes.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: I think also we need to step away from the fact that we're a novelty, that we're something fun and new and something bizarre, etc. The Internet is getting middle-aged. It's something that has been here, something that is staying, something that we use every day that is becoming a utility that no local government would dream for political reasons to shut down the electricity or stop the water or anything like that. We're one of those. We're a utility. It's a big responsibility to take. It's a big responsibility to continue to manage. But it's not a political tool to shine in front of people. So it needs to be also part of the discussion when a TLD arrives in a city, when it becomes a local utility, as to how serious are we all about it because it's not something that is here for

two years, for five years, for a political term. It's something that is here to stay.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE:

We are in constant talks with the city for formal reasons, what we agreed to contractual wise to do so. But else, we monitor pretty closely what new campaigns the city plans and so on. And if there are campaigns where our domain name might fit into very well, we approach then the respective part of that city administration and say, "We have a nice domain name. Do you want to make use of that?" So where we can interact and give some value for this kind of communication campaigns, we do so.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE:

Having heard one detail of your question, changing from left to right, governments change, etc., our partner is not the political party in the city. It's the city administration that normally should not take any position [of their role] in government, officially at least. For sure, there is some influence, but at least we in Vienna did not experience any change when we had a new mayor. So it might be different close to where we are here, but at least in our space it is we have the contract with the administration, not the political party. And I'm very glad to have it that way.

AMADEU ABRIL:

Now? Yes, in our case, CORE, but also the case of puntCAT, in all the cases in which we work with a TLD that represents a geographic

territory, we insisted that the public authority be directly the registry operator. And therefore, puntCAT or CORE are just the service providers that have different kind of arrangements but always the decision making entity for the TLD is the public authority. On the contrary, for those that represent linguistic and cultural TLDs, we are always advised these to be private entities representing civil society without the presence of public authorities.

They also follow the [inaudible] advice. In that case, we were with them and normally they present the results, but for linguistic and cultural TLDs it's different. Regarding with the geographic TLDs, it's very different because in some cases during the application period the public administration was very present and once the TLD was there somehow they were not interested in overseeing that from the very close and following up. In come cases the contrary. So it really depends in each different TLD there is a different relationship with the different governments.

One trend that has been always present in [inaudible] countries is that you have lots of departments involved and not always is the same department that takes the lead in that. So suddenly, you are with the economic development, and suddenly it's tourism that takes the lead, and now it's the legal service, and you go back to another one. This has happened in more than one TLD.

SEBASTIEN DUCOS: Okay, I think that we ran out of time for this session. It's been good. Thank you for your questions. We have another little break now, and we pick up again in 15 minutes. Okay, good.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Good evening, everybody. We're going to start the next session. This session is about cities providing strategies and using domains for promoting themselves. We have a wonderful panel from different countries. We have first Consol Vancells from Barcelona. You want to introduce yourself?

CONSOL VANCELLS: Hi. I am the city branding coordinator of the Barcelona City Council. I have colleagues with me from Barcelona City Council as well. The ones representing the digital communication department, [Christina] and [David].

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Great. And then we have Lori Anne from New York, pretty far away.

LORI ANNE WARDI: Hi there. My name is Lori Anne Wardi. I'm VP of business development at Neustar. I'm also the general manager of the .nyc domain and previous to that was one of the cofounders of the company behind the .co domain. So I have a lot of domain experience in domains.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Then we have [Else] from Ghent.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Hello. I'm [Else] from Ghent in Belgium. I work also in city branding and international relations, and I was one of the project members when we introduced the domain .gent.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: And Emilie from Paris.

EMILIE TURBAT: Hello, I'm Emilie Turbat. I'm chief marketing and sales officer at AFNIC. AFNIC is a French not-for-profit organization appointed by the French state to manage the 3.2 million .fr domains. But AFNIC is also the number one registry services provider in France serving all French geo TLDs like .paris that we manage along with CORE. We are also backend for .bzh, [.alsace], and .corsica. So I'm working in the domain name industry for ten years, and I've been accompanying the city of Paris for the .paris project for almost ten years now.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Fantastic. So as you can see, it's a wonderful panel. Everybody is a woman. I am the exception here, which is fantastic and great. So wonderful panel.

We see the world through the classifications that we make to the world. In Internet, there was something missing in this classification. We

classified Internet with companies and public organizations, with [states] and so on. But cities were not there, and this is an important thing because it focuses our view of the world in a completely different sense and focuses the importance of what we see as how the classification is established. So it seems that now we have the opportunity to [redress] this thing and put cities in the picture.

We're going to see several of these experiences. Maybe we will start with .barcelona with Consol. That is the first city and the one that is hosting the meeting.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: In alphabetical order.

CONSOL VANCELLS: [inaudible] Barcelona. Okay, thank you, [inaudible]. It's a pleasure to be here. First of all, let me be very grateful to the organization, to the ICANN for making this city's presence possible. Thank you so much, Andrea, and thank you for the Fundacio puntCAT. And Amadeu [inaudible] because it was a tough work that we all succeeded to be here this afternoon. It was difficult, but we succeeded and we are very grateful to [Else] and Emilie and Lori Anne to join us because we call them all to be here this afternoon. And my special personal gratitude [Christina] [inaudible] and [David Esteve] because they were helping me a lot with the content of this presentation we are presenting now.

So let's begin with Barcelona. It's nice that Amadeu was talking about the different strategies and successes of the strategies related to the

government and what are their objectives. I am happy to say, not to announce, but to say that at Barcelona City Council we are living in a moment of the start lining because we are beginning to share the new city branding of Barcelona with the strategy of the digital communication department. So we are happy that we are working together to build a new strategy related to the identity of the city, to the DNA of the city so that we can share our values and our DNA through the domains we're sharing with the world through the .barcelona.

First of all, I will introduce what we are doing with the city branding strategy, which I am really enthusiastic with these exciting experiences with all of the stakeholders of the city. We began a year and a half with making possible to all the stakeholders in the city could participate in this city branding project.

In 2017, it was the 35th anniversary of the Olympic Games of Barcelona. Any one of you was here 35 years ago? Apart from the Catalan people. So it was about time. The city council decided it was about time that we could rethink what is Barcelona. What is the message Barcelona could offer to the world after all these years?

You know that the world has changed, especially really the technological changes. The economy has moved in different ways, different tools, different channels since we have Internet and the technology. So the way we attract talent or we attract investment and we attract companies to come to our cities has changed radically. And on the other hand, it's true that the cities, population is moving toward

cities. The United Nations says that two-thirds of the population will be living in cities in 2050.

So it is important that cities look for their space, their new message in the world. And the world is so competitive that the cities need to identify what is their value proposition. What is the new message they have to offer to the world? So that was the objective we began in 2017, and the city council wanted to give a new impetus to the Barcelona brand with the launch of this project which I am in charge of.

We have three very important pillars. The first one is the management of the identity and the reputation of Barcelona city brand. You know that thing of the brand we could be talking for hours what the hell is this thing called brand. But wise men and wise women, wise experts say that brands reside in people's minds. So Barcelona brand is what all of us think we think is Barcelona when we close our eyes and we listen to this word.

So we could be all cocreators of the brand. Since this is so, we wanted this to be a cocreation project with all of the stakeholders of the city. We want to have an alliance with all of the stakeholders of the city to identify which is our value proposition. So this was our formula. The participation of all local stakeholders, metropolitan stakeholders, and even international stakeholders. So we wanted to listen to everyone to identify what is the DNA of Barcelona in the 21st century.

And the third point and the most important maybe is what this city branding is all about. Brand is a platform to help people, to help citizens. It's a platform to boost local economy and to help people for

better employment, better quality of their employment. So these are the objectives of our project.

As you know, we had our plans, but reality comes and changes our plans and that happened to us. Our main action was the definition of the new [inaudible] of Barcelona and to create a three-year activation plan. But as you all know, a year ago we had a terrorist attack in Barcelona and afterwards we had a difficult political process in our city. Both things were important enough that we considered to change the order of our objectives and instead of beginning with the definition of the new [inaudible] of Barcelona, we began with an international reputation campaign.

And a city [inaudible] resilience barometer, we designed a new barometer to be able to measure how the perception of the city can change related to external [shocks] such as the terrorism attack and others that we may have. We can say we are pioneers on these kinds of barometers and we are happy to share with other cities if you want to talk about it later.

The point is that to do the third point which is the most important point for us was the definition of the new [inaudible] of Barcelona, our plan was as it is said very quickly. We began 2017, we called city branding representatives of other cities to explain their experiences. We called cities like Tel Aviv or Oslo or Milan or Stockholm to explain how they work with the city branding process. Afterwards, we did international and local market studies. We had more than 50 individual interviews with public representatives. And we organized 39 thematic workshops

with representatives of all of the sectors of the city. So we called 300 people to listen to all of them what was Barcelona for them, what did they listen about Barcelona when they traveled, how do they explain Barcelona. And we are about to present the results in some weeks, I hope.

In the meantime, we are defining this new storytelling. We are working on our digital agenda. So what was important for us is we had to work hand-in-hand to align the strategies of the digital communication department and the city branding ones. So it's true that for us, for the city of Barcelona that the strategy was that in this world where there is a fierce competition between domains, the branded content domains were the key we could offer to the world. So therefore we are focused on our storytelling and we want to make our brand related to our pillars and to our values. And that's the way we decided to organize the domains to build up strategic domains related to our values were the ones we wanted to use with the domain .barcelona.

So to make a comparison with – okay, related to each one of our pillars, we began to identify the domains with the strategic access of the city model. For instance, for us the reduction of the digital gap is an important point, so that's why we have some of the websites in the city council related to those matters. But we are very young and we are beginners because we began in 2016 and we only have 6,000 domains. But we are here to listen to all experiences and we would like to see next year in Rio if we can show the results of our work.

We have the Fundacio puntCAT are the managers of our [concession] and they are veteran geo TLDs, as you know with Amadeu. So related to the city alliance with the stakeholders, we wanted to use the Barcelona domain as a way to reinforce the digital identity of the city with other entities and companies and platforms to use it. And at the end of the day, the .barcelona is a digital tool to promote the city brand.

We have an interesting example in that we created the always.barcelona as the repository of our international campaign for the reputation I talked to you before. In Barcelona, the Barcelona City Council has more than 500 websites, and that was difficult to ask to make all them to go to the .barcelona. So we preferred to, as the girl from Berlin said previously, it was not about a mechanical change we had to do. We would prefer to give value to all our websites. The one associated to the DNA of Barcelona, so that's why this was our strategy with the sites of the city.

As an example, the domini.barcelona is the channel through the one you can have your domain of Barcelona. And as I said, we are still very young and we cannot measure results. Our success is to be here and to be able to organize this panel. We think that next year in Rio we will be able to go farther and explain more things related to our new storytelling. But to us, the real success is to be here and to be able to share with all of you the experiences of other cities who have done this way before.

As an example of the city alliance, we created this always.barcelona with [inaudible]. When we wanted to explain the word Barcelona it's

always Barcelona, and Barcelona is always energetic and very open no matter what external shocks we had during the period of last autumn.

I like very much this next example. It's the neighborhood [plans]. This project [inaudible] to transform [inaudible] in the field of education, social rights, economic activity, and [inaudible] ecology. This is very much the DNA of Barcelona. It's interesting because through this the incomes we have from these domains we can reinvest to solve the objectives we created for this plan in the neighborhood. I understand this is a very nice experience of the department of digital communication that they want to show citizens how we can break this gap, this digital gap, showing that through these websites we can reinvest money in the benefit of the neighbors and citizens of the city.

As an example also of the brand as a platform to boost local economy, we have the example of not tourism.barcelona but fairtourism.barcelona which was a campaign in favor of fair and sustainable tourism against illegal accommodations. As you know this thing of tourism could be a subject for another panel as well.

So for us, we are very happy that we are trying make an effort on the quality of these .barcelona sites not on the quantity of the sites. We prefer to identify the DNA of Barcelona on the work we are doing with the different sites.

To show you an example, the sites we are working with are related to the economy, historical memory, social rights, [inaudible] and mobility, rights with citizens, etc. This is more or less a map of the domains of the city of Barcelona. Apart from the domains, we have those other

domains, an example of the domains from others. As I told you, we have still a long way to go. We just have 6,000 domains, but we are happy to say that we have a 90% renewal rate and our organic growth is over 5%. So we hope that when we come to Rio, we will show you new data.

But to promote these domains, we are about to present now a campaign to promote to help people to participate in this domain. Oh, I thought there was movement. There's no movement? Okay, so you can imagine the campaign, but we are about to begin with this second round campaign to promote these domains in Barcelona.

And I hope this is it, and furthermore I can answer some questions. Thank you very much.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Thank you. Thank you so much. From Barcelona to New York. New York is [inaudible], has many more domains, so I hope we can learn a lot.

LORI ANNE WARDI: Thank you so much again for having me here today. I'm really happy to be here to talk about city TLDs in particular. I'm particularly proud of New York City. Which is the one I'm using here?

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: The right.

LORI ANNE WARDI:

Thank you. Despite working in the domain industry, I'm technologically challenged, so I'll just admit that before we start. Before we jump into the topic of branding, I just want to share a little bit of the facts about .nyc. New York City began its quest to have its own branded domain back in 2008. The concept was really included in the city's digital roadmap well before the new gTLD program ever really got started. In 2012, Neustar which is my company, our company, was awarded the contract to manage the marketing and administration of the .nyc through a competitive procurement process. And then in 2014, .nyc both executed the agreement with ICANN and launched the TLD under the de Blasio administration. So it started in Bloomberg administration and launched in the de Blasio administration, and it's still very actively managed through the de Blasio administration.

Since then it has been really exciting to watch as we've gone from idea to a flourishing actual TLD that's really if you spend any time in New York City, I don't know if any of you have seen it, but if you do spend any time in New York City, you can't help but bump into it. You'll see it in ads on the trains, in the buses, on restaurant menus, on construction sites, on real estate ads. It's really everywhere. It has infiltrated a great deal, so it's always exciting. My heart always skips a beat. Every time when I see one, I get super excited. I take pictures. I send it to our team. We are all excited to see it, and I'm sure that happens to you as well when you see your own city in lights.

In addition to serving as a very powerful city branding tool, it's also a public diplomacy tool, really sharing with the rest of the world the innovations, the creativity of the people of the city. That's what's one of

the things that's so exciting. It also has a lot of other great results from, as you mentioned, economic development, civic engagement, community building. These are all some of the ancillary benefits of this top-level domain.

I'm proud to be here today to share with you some of our lessons learned. The vision of the city of New York when this all came to pass was to create a web address that would serve as a public benefit to New Yorkers. The way they saw it was this is no different than the libraries or city parks. We want to create something special exclusively for New Yorkers. And in fact, the .nyc domain name is exclusively available for New Yorkers. So you can't register it if you're not in the five boroughs. And when you go to register a domain, there is a validation process to make sure you actually are a resident or a business that's located in the city of New York. That was very hotly contested because a lot of cities are open. But New York made a very conscious effort to make their domain exclusive to New Yorkers.

While it's exclusive to New Yorkers, there's a little bit of a paradox because they also wanted to be as inclusive as possible of New Yorkers. Because there are five boroughs in New York and oftentimes with business and with high profile things what happens in New York is everything is focused on Manhattan, now Manhattan and Brooklyn, and Staten Island, Queens, and the Bronx kind of get left behind. So while it's exclusive to New York, the city of New York made a very conscious effort to make it as inclusive as possible of all New Yorkers at every social and economic strata.

The other part of the vision was to give New Yorkers an official way to brand and own their identity online and to allow New Yorkers to showcase their New York City affiliation and location as really an enviable component of their success. I think we've all seen brands like Donna Karan, DKNY; Maybelline New York. There are a lot of brands that like to affiliate themselves with New York because New York is hip and cool and everybody likes the cache of New York.

So when conceptualizing this TLD brand, the idea was let's let our own residents and businesses benefit from the cache of being in New York. You know there's that phrase: "If you can make it there, you'll make it anywhere," thanks to Frank Sinatra. But there's something true to that. What New York didn't want to happen was people elsewhere pretending to be from New York or leveraging the New York brand who didn't deserve it by not being a resident or a business. So that's why they're very strict about enforcing you needing to be a New Yorker.

This is actually a quote from [Jeff Merritt]. Not a quote, but this came from a quote. He basically said that when conceptualizing this idea that they wanted companies and individuals in the five boroughs to have a leg up in the world and to be able to stand out in the crazy marketplace of the world of the Internet where there's so much competition and there are so many thousands and hundreds of thousands of competing businesses. We wanted people to be able to say, "I'm from New York City. I get a special pat on the back."

Some of the key value propositions of the brand are the exclusivity, the legitimacy – this is a true New York business or individual – and localization. It really helps brand your local business or brand.

Just a few little facts about the numbers. Currently, there are about 69,000 domains under management. At some point, there were in the 70s, like 75,000 or 76,000 I think when we were at our peak. It's very hard. I'm sure all of you who manage city TLDs know. It's very hard because there are constantly people adding and dropping. From the very start when we worked with the government, we all agreed that we would not do vanity metrics. Like number of domains under management would not be our first concern. What we wanted was quality, as you mentioned. We want to see people building things, creating value, and see a real thriving community of users on our space. And that's what we really are focused on.

So the stat we're really proud of is the next one, which is 112 .nyc sites are in the Alexa top one million. We look at that all the time. It has been growing. And the sites that are in there are sites to be really proud of because they're competing on a world stage.

One of the things that has been interesting for us is that 51% of our registrants are individuals as opposed to 49% being businesses. We had really thought that would not be the case. Now bear in mind, in New York City a lot of businesses are solopreneurs or individuals maybe registering for their small business. So it's a little bit fuzzy how accurate that number is, but that I thought you'd find an interesting fact.

Now getting more into the branding side, New York City is really a town, and as you said, when you close your eyes what does it mean? It means something different to everybody. But some of the things that I think New York City is associated with are hustle and heart, and it's associated with glamor as much it is with grit. So it kind of runs the gamut. And again, generally people feel like if you can make it there, you can make it anywhere. The experience is not the same for any two people who experience New York. So from a branding perspective there's this feeling of high energy, being eclectic and also electric at the same time.

So it has been our job at Neustar and working directly in tandem with the city of New York to ensure that the .nyc namespace really becomes a digital mirror of the dynamism of what is actually happening in the city. From the very start, we've tried to leverage the power of the New York City brand and community to rally New Yorkers to build their businesses and brands on the New York space so that the space really does reflect and become a mirror.

That was really our charge, our mission, and this is reflective of a lot of our branding. "The city is a part of you; make it a part of your web address." Actually, this next slide is really about the tagline that we use. I think this is really – I love this tagline because not only is it a call to action, [Own Your .nyc], but at the same time it really was indicative of the New York ethos. It's that grit. It's that if you're making it in New York, you're doing something right because it's actually hard to do. So the tagline is more than a call to action. The idea was that it's a state of mind and it's that voice inside the person who has got the idea, who has

got the dream, who wants to create or build something. Go out there and make it happen. Own it. So not only do you own your business, not only do you own your dream, your community, your message, but you own now your slice of New York digital real estate.

Our website actually for those who are interested when you are bored or you have a minute is OwnIt.nyc. On it, you'll see a lot of our messaging and marketing.

The next slide, you'll see some of our Own It messaging in practice. Only New Yorkers can own it. We use that over and over as our call to action, but also you'll see – I don't know if you guys can read it. My eyes are really bad, but these are the kinds of things we message. "The city's in her lyrics; now it's in her web address." These are real people, real use cases that we pulled out to showcase the city of New York.

Again, one of the things I love to share which I think is helpful for all of you is out of home advertising like this has been extremely successful for us, and we were very fortunate in that the city of New York recognized the importance of showing the use of the domains. So they give us public service announcement space on bus shelters and in the trains stations and things of that nature. I wouldn't say we have a whole lot, but we have a good amount every month where we showcase our public service announcements. And our public service announcements are basically finding really useful and meaningful New Yorkers who are doing great things and showing them off. We don't make up ads. We really find people who are compelling in New York doing compelling

things and we show them off in the advertisements in the public service announcements.

Here are three more of them. The first one on the left is the Beekeepers Association of New York City. Who would guess that they have that? “It’s a hive for urban beekeepers.” The next one is Bike.nyc which is the city’s biking. Every year they organize bike tours and bike races, and they helped get the city mobilized for bike lanes and all of those things. “Old school transportation has a brand new web address.” We’re trying to really connect the brand with what’s happening in the city.

These are a few more case studies. These are case studies that I think are relevant because while the city of New York does not use .nyc in its government actions – so it still uses the .gov for official city business – the city of New York does really work hard to help find public-private partnerships or advertising campaigns using the domain.

Voting.nyc was all over the city and is all over the city right now because it’s election city. “Driving people to the polls.” Women.nyc, New York City was the first municipality to create a city venture fund to support women entrepreneurs. Secure.nyc, this is something I just bumped into on a bus shelter. I had no idea what it was, but the city came out with an app to help people find good Wi-Fi versus bad Wi-Fi where they could be at risk of people phishing and stealing their data. Ferry.nyc is the city’s ferry service.

WePark is not from the city of New York the government, but it’s the city’s largest parking company. You know in New York City parking is one of the hardest things to do, and there’s WePark.nyc signs

everywhere all over the city. Actually, that's an interesting point that I think will be valuable to you guys. WePark was one of our original founders, ambassadors when we first launched. One of the things we did that I think is helpful for others is we said we'll give you the domain name WePark.nyc before we launch officially or during the first couple of months if you'll put it in your signs. So they agreed. They got the name; we got the branding.

Every time one of these domains is used in a functional way, it's like a brand multiplier. It's more valuable than anything you can pay to put in an advertisement. So the best thing that we've done and the best thing that can be done is to find – and many people have said it here today, I'm just repeating what others have said – finding great and compelling use cases and watching them do their thing. Because every time they use it, it helps everything else.

So that's on the case studies. Lastly, we work very hard to create a community around the .nyc domain and to celebrate the community that already is New York City. There is a program that the city of New York manages. Actually, Neustar, we don't manage it for the city. It's called neighborhoods.nyc. They reserved all of the city names and there are hub pages for different neighborhoods, and local city groups can apply to be the sub managers of those names. You get all sorts of information about traffic patterns and alternate side of the street parking and information you need about that local area.

Then lastly, the last two years we've been running this Best of the Boroughs contest to encourage people to share what they're building

on their .nyc domains and how those domains and websites that they're building are having an impact on the community. This year, we just finished our 2018 contest. All five boroughs were represented. I think we had about 70 applicants who submitted, and we had five winners. Each won \$5,000 to help them build their business or community. We just had an event, and it really was great to have people in the room talking about what an impact having the .nyc has had for them.

So I think that's all I have. I tried to fit a lot in eight to ten slides. Anyway, thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE:

Thank you so much, Lori Anne. It's really impressive what the city of New York has been doing beyond the brand, mobilizing and augmenting the voice of the citizens and giving different new voice using this brand. It's fantastic.

From a [magic] city to a wonderful city of Ghent in Europe.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE:

Indeed. Can I get a clicker? Hello, everybody. Barcelona said they were feeling modest. Now I feel even more modest compared to Barcelona and New York. I come from Ghent. Ghent is Flemish, a Dutch speaking city in Belgium. We are about 260,000 inhabitants, so compared to these cities we are a very small city. But we like to call ourselves a pocket sized metropolis because compared to our size we have quite a lot to offer. We're the biggest university city in Belgium. We have a port.

We have a very cultural and medieval city. And we're also very centrally located. We're three hours from Paris, London, and Amsterdam. So that also gives us an added value.

As a city, I work for the city administration, so not for a company. I'm a civil servant. Within the city administration, we have a long-term strategy which is determined by our DNA and which describes how the city but also other stakeholders like the ports, the university, and so on which mission we have.

Integrated in this general strategy is our digital strategy. Over the last decades, although we're quite small, we've been a pioneer on a national and international level when it comes to digital tools and actions. We were the first city in Belgium more than 20 years ago to launch a website for the city. We were also the first city in Belgium to have more than ten years ago social media and a social media strategy. And over the last few years, we've been working on open data, data visualization and so on. We're also active on a digital level on a European scale. For example, together with Barcelona we're chairing or vice chairing the Knowledge Society Forum in the Eurocities Network. So we try to be active and try to share knowledge and try to promote ourselves as a digital city.

Like Barcelona, we're also constantly working on our city branding. We have written our story ten years ago, or we started branding our city ten years ago. But, of course, it's an ongoing process. You can here read a quote by our mayor. He says that with us like in most other cities, city branding is not about communication or promotion. Actually, we like

to speak about city making because we have determined certain values, certain USPs and we want to develop our city in relation to these USPs. So we try to convince other parties to do things in our city that strengthen our brand.

How do we do that? We have our USPs and our values [inaudible], as I said, as a culture city but we also like to promote ourselves as a green city, as a child friendly city and as an innovative city. Our values, we try to promote ourselves as open and as authentic. Like Barcelona, we try to create an alliance with other stakeholders and try to offer them a common story they can all use. We don't have a logo or anything that other stakeholders can use. The citizens of Ghent are quite stubborn, and the biggest Flemish city in Flanders, Antwerp, designed a logo that all the stakeholders could use but, again, that doesn't work. We just let the people use their own logo, but it's more important that they share the same story, the same values, and we believe that works better.

In Ghent, our branding is not targeted to one audience in particular. We try to attract and retain civilians, but we also try of course to convince tourists to come to our city or investors to start a company. So we have a multiple target audience approach.

What does our branding mean? We have tools and products. Of course, we have communication campaigns and tools, magazines, websites, and so on. We also have a program on hospitality. So if journalists or other delegations come to the city, we like to receive them in the best way possible. We're active in international networks because in that way we can also promote ourselves.

As said, we try to make our city in line with our DNA and our branding strategy, and therefore we create events. For example, we had a very good light plan, so historic buildings were lit in a particular way, but it was not known. Then we decided to organize a big light festival which is the biggest in Belgium. So we created an event that was in line with our DNA and this acts for promoting our city. And [inaudible] also bid for awards and rankings.

And last but not least, we do branding. Like any other city, we have a logo and a look and feel. But we, for example, also have an audio logo, a sort of sound logo, a certain tune we can use in our own videos. And we also see our .gent TLD as a sort of branding tool.

The fact that I'm invited here today is perhaps because we were the first city in Flanders to apply for a geo TLD. Apart from Ghent, there's only Brussels and Flanders. We started with the process like many others. We launched in 2014, but we actually got approached by a private company called Combell who wanted to start with the .gent domain name. What is our experience as a city that it was an advantage to work together with Combell. We were enthusiastic about their idea to start with .gent, but we didn't have the technical expertise. So the private-public participation in that way was needed, otherwise we couldn't have done that.

What was also experienced as an organization that the moment that Combell came to us and the TLD was launched was a good moment for us because we were also reshaping our homepage, our website of the city. Before it was called gent.be and now it's called stad.gent. But it

was more than just changing a URL. We were redesigning the website, so that was also perfect timing.

What was also an advantage of launching the .gent domain name was that it was a moment for us, a momentum to look at all the websites we had within the administration. There were heaps of websites. Every museum, every service, every neighborhood had his own website linked to the city council, and it was a moment to make a list of what was there. And not only a list but also to look at all the websites that were on the list and had a .be URL before were still needed. So it was also a good exercise looking at our digital communication and standardizing and uniforming it more.

What also is one of the experiences within the city administration is that we also changed our mail address. So it was not only about domain names but also about mail addresses. For that, we had an internal campaign.

When we launched the .gent domain, we also had some political questions. Whether it was needed. What was the advantage? What was already talked about here. And also some questions on ethics because it was a private. Combell is owning our domain, so what if someone would apply for a domain name that was not what we wanted. So we sort of, like most cities I guess, made agreements with Combell what domain names could be possible and what not. For example, they got a question to get fuck.gent, and it was not allowed. So we got a political question on that and so on. It was also a moment to make our politicians more aware of the whole domain issue.

And then more related to branding, as I said, [inaudible] in the city we're about communication and promotion but we're also about city making. We try to convince our citizens or organizations to shape our city in a certain way. We're not controlling everything. We just offer them platforms so they can shape the city. To us, having the .gent domain name is just another platform we offer to our citizens. Compared to, for example, New York we as a city council are less active in branding the domain as itself. It's just an opportunity we offer to citizens. We have other platforms. For example, we were the first city in Belgium to have a crowdsourcing platform owned by the city, and that could also be used by our inhabitants if they were looking for crowd funding money. So it's just another platform for us.

Of course, we are in Belgium one of the biggest IT cities. We have more startups and scale ups than in other Belgian cities. And also being innovative is part of our DNA and our branding. So the fact that we started as a first with .gent also fitted within this branding philosophy of us.

And then as said before, because we changed all our URLs and e-mail addresses, still today .gent is still a very important visual marker in all our communication. We have a certain format in which all our posters, all our brochures should be made and on all these publications and digital tools there's always a .gent domain name. And even if we develop new applications today, we always use a .gent. For example, we have a yearly hackathon contest Apps for Ghent where civilians can develop apps with our open data, and all these apps have the .gent domain as URL.

I also asked Combell what their experience with .gent was and why they started it. They started it because they knew that new TLDs would be able to be launched. But they also started it because they were proud Ghentians. They were a company from Ghent, so for them it was also an opportunity. Of course, they wanted to be – it was I suppose a financial issue, but it was also an issue of being proud of their city and doing something that would put their city on the digital map. So it was thanks to their initiative that we became the first city in Belgium to have a TLD domain name.

When I look at the numbers, I see that we had a quick start. And from then on we had a slow, steady growth with little dropout. So after six months after the launch, we had risen [15%] which was more than, for example, Brussels and Flanders. And we were [on the] number 13 of the worldwide growth [in that]. Today, we have about 3,600 domains, which is maybe not so much but when you compare it to the number of inhabitants we have, it means that we have about 1 .gent domain name per 70 inhabitants. So that's not too bad.

Also, Combell because they own it, it's a private company, they didn't offer freebies. Although when I saw the slides of the price, I think they offer it today for 25 euros so it's not that expensive.

And when we look at the numbers today of who is using a .gent domain name, we see that it's, of course, used within the city administration. When we started, there was a list of about 300 URLs we reserved for the city.

But it's, on the other hand, also very strong in retail. When I looked up – I Googled it and I saw, for example, [inaudible].gent. It's where you can buy French fries. Or MindfulnessCenter.gent. So you have a lot of small companies, SMEs, that use it as a domain name, more than as big companies. We also have a Volvo plant in Ghent or the big university. Unfortunately, they don't use it yet. We also see that some companies have reserved it but are not using it yet just because they haven't opened a branch in Ghent yet. For example, Apple.gent is reserved, but it's not used yet. But I guess it's when Apple will have the idea to start a new shop in Ghent they can use it.

So it's used by retail. It's also used a lot by the tech community. They were the first to start with it. So they were the ones to buy it or to sell it to other clients of them. It's also used by what we call ambassadors. For example, we had local elections last weekend, and the candidate that got the most votes and will perhaps probably become mayor – it's not sure yet, they're still talking – is called [inaudible] and his URL [inaudible].gent. So in that way, he also showed his link to the city and that he was the candidate to become mayor.

And then Combell, I asked them what their future plans are, and they mainly see new clients with new companies starting up. If companies already had a .be domain name, it's harder to convince them to switch. So they might in the future invest more on the branding and on reaching the clients that they would want to convince to switch.

And then finally about the future, we like to call ourselves in Ghent a city of people. For us, ICT is but an enabler and we try to invest in

cocreation first and foremost. In the near future, we will have some pilots to research how we can develop innovative solutions for societal problems.

The first pilot we have will be on care, how can we use ICT in a care environment and create innovative solutions in that. And if we have such solutions – I don't know what they will be yet, it can be an app, it can be a platform – of course, if we as a city are involved in it, it will also get the domain name .gent.

As I said, we just had elections, so from January on we will have a new city council. That means that we will also have to look at our city branding strategy again. Then the question is whether we will be more active than we are today in promoting .gent as a branding tool.

And finally, there were also some talks last year with Aral Balkan. He calls himself a cyborg rights activist. He's actually battling against the Silicon Valley/Google big ones. He wants to create an indie Net where people own their own part of the Internet. We might, it's not sure yet, collaborate from the city of Ghent with him and create for every citizen a separate piece on the Internet called [inaudible]. If that were to happen, then we would also offer our inhabitants – I'm called [Else] – [Else].gent or whatever. So they would get their own small, secure piece of the Internet where they can be active. But we're still looking for funding for that project, so I'm not sure whether it will happen or not.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Well, again, impressive. Danke [inaudible].

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Danke [inaudible].

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Now we move to Paris. C'est a vous.

EMILIE TURBAT: Thank you for having me on this panel tonight. I don't have any presentation. I'm going to try to be very quick now because time is running out. It's already 6:00, and I think everybody is getting tired. So I'm going to try to be quick.

As New York explained, the city of Paris has also been convinced very early by the great opportunity offered by a new gTLD. It was back in 2008 when they decided that they will develop a project to have a .paris TLD. This is mostly thanks to .cat that has been an inspiration and a model for the city of Paris for it's .paris, so thank you, .cat, for showing us the way.

Since 2008, the vision of the city of Paris has been to build a digital territory for Paris to further support the spreading of Paris values and give its citizens new opportunities. Giving its citizens new opportunities is the reason why it was really important for the city of Paris to give priority during the launch phases of its TLD not only to international brands through the TMCH phase, Sunrise phase, but also to local brands, local companies, small local companies, and of course local administration also.

The way the city markets .paris is the following. There are three main goals for .paris. First, it intends to ease participative democracy in the city of Paris. That's why the city has developed websites that enable citizens to share ideas between citizens but also with the city of Paris to enable the city to decide for a project that will help the citizens. So .paris allows citizens to mobilize themselves more easily for important local causes, and it can also be a significant help for neighborhoods or district associations. So it's the way it can help the Parisians.

Also, as Paris is a very touristic city, .paris allows tourists and curious people to easily find the places and monuments that make up the reputation of Paris as well as the different points of interest of the city. Of course, .paris is there to help the Parisian business to grow. By turning geographical affiliation into an essential element of their digital presence, Parisian companies benefit from Paris' image. That's what you also explained about New York. So in the fields of gastronomy, fashion, or culture, major brands and prestigious establishments systematically should associate themselves to Paris. As they do in their general branding, so now they can use .paris for that.

Coming back to the way .paris was launched, we chose to have what we called back then a pioneer period. This period lasted about six months before the general opening of .paris. For this pioneer period, AFNIC and CORE recruited almost 100 pioneers to raise awareness about .paris before the launch, before the general opening. Those pioneers were not only big French brands, big French companies with a strong relation to Paris, but also Parisian startups and all kinds of local actors like neighborhood associations, like local radios. So it was a very nice

program to help raise awareness about the arrival of this new digital territory.

Also, to support the launch of .paris, the city of Paris made at that time a big campaign based on the claim “the most affordable address in Paris.” As you know, real estate is very expensive in Paris, so we make great fun of having a not-so-expensive address available in Paris. And there were plenty available back then. Now we have almost 21,000 domains in .paris.

What did I want to say? Oh, yeah. I wanted to let you know about another program that we had to give value to the .paris domain. We had a premium names campaign about one year after the general opening that was back in 2014. This premium sales was done in two phases. First, we started with an online auction. We developed an online auction platform specifically for .paris, and we scheduled the auction based on the economic sector. We grouped the premium names, we sorted them by economic sector. Like we had tourism, local services, food, luxury, and so on.

So this auction platform had very nice results. The record was with football.paris, which does not belong PSG. After six months, we closed the platform and the premium were sold normally through registrars. We sell premium names every month. Not many of them, but it is consistent in time and they renew very, very well. So we are happy with having done a premium name campaign.

What else? We are not doing large campaigns. Everything is .paris launched. But this year we tested commercial operations with the

registrars. We tested price reduction, and we saw that in a certain level it can work. We tested to sell .paris for maximum 25 euros, but not much under that price, and it made very nice results. It proved to boost the registration this year. What was nice is that this price level is still high enough to maintain the value perception of the .paris domain names, but it helps gaining more registrations. So I think we will try to go on testing that kind of commercial operation with the .paris registrars.

So that's it for me, and I think it gives us still some time for the exchanges that we wanted to have.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE:

Absolutely. Merci beaucoup, Emilie. Fantastic, all these approaches from different cities. I have a small question for all of you. All these new domains [inaudible] for sure a great opportunity, also a great challenge because domains are pretty well established and everybody recognizes all the domains established. So it's very difficult to introduce a new domain. And all this on top it's moderated by quite a great deal of responsibility because you are playing with very important [bands], particularly for the citizens full of political [strings]. How do you manage this tension when challenge, opportunity, responsibility that you have in the [middle]? It sounds complicated. Anybody?

LORI ANNE WARDI:

Well, I think that there's so many uses for different domains, and at this point, I think in the old days people would try to convince. "You should switch from this domain to this domain because ours is better." I don't

think that's the case anymore. I think there are so many lanes to swim in and there are so many needs for digital presence that you can have a .com, a .co, and a .nyc for different purposes. It could be a URL shortener. One could be for a campaign. One could be for your main website.

So the government, for example, of New York has told us specifically, "We're not going to change from our .gov domains because that's what we think brings legitimacy to our government purpose. But we're going to find other ways to help promote because we think this is a value proposition for the city of New York. So we'll use it for public-private partnerships and we'll use it for different marketing campaigns that we have." So you have to be flexible and not assume that your domain is the one solution for everything and just let it be useful for what it's useful for, and then continue to let everybody do what's best for them for their own business purpose.

CONSOL VANCELLS:

To me, I understand the formula we are working with [inaudible] experience is absolutely scalable. We can use it for the digital arena because it's a matter of putting together all of the stakeholders and it's always a difficult equilibrium between different parties, different interests. But the point is that with the city branding what we did is we listened to everyone so that we could all convene on what is the identity and the DNA of the city. Since the city is, let's say, a committed city or it is an open city, it seems from these values that we decided to create different domains related to this DNA.

And it's difficult [with] the politicians; it is not impossible because they always can improve. But it is difficult for politicians to change this because this is the voice of many people: different stakeholders; local, international, private institutions; citizens participating. So the pillars of the brand are difficult to change from political opinions.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE:

I fully agree with what Consol says. If you have a bottom-up approach, it's harder for politicians to disagree with it. For the rest I think, like said in New York, it's a possibility. You're not obliged to use a certain domain name. It's a platform, a possibility you offer to your citizens. Or, for example, in Ghent we tried to offer our investors, pictures, texts, whatever they can use when they go abroad. Of course, they're not obliged to do that, but it can be an added value to them and it can be an extra bonus to brand themselves as someone from Ghent. I think this fits in the same picture. If your brand is strong enough, people will be proud to use it. So it's something you have to be proud of and not something you have to feel obliged.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE:

One question that we have is, one curiosity more than a question is, who is registering? What type of companies are registering in these domains? Private companies? Public companies? It was clear in the case of New York you have these huge campaigns.

LORI ANNE WARDI: I think the companies that are mostly registering them are local. A lot of them are local companies. Restaurants are using them. Real estate agents are using them.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Small businesses.

LORI ANNE WARDI: Small businesses. Then tech entrepreneurs are using them. So tech entrepreneurs who are creative and they see a use case for maybe they're creating an app for local restaurants. So a lot of tech entrepreneurs. And then big brands do use them, but they use them not for their main site. We haven't had any major brand change their whole brand. But, for example, eBay has eBay.nyc which they use for their local event space when they're having local events. Or Google has Google.nyc. They use it for something. I think Tiffany uses T.nyc as it's URL shortener. So we see big brands using it, but not as much as the startups and the local businesses.

EMILIE TURBAT: I would say about .paris that we observe quite the same. The registrants that actually use their .paris domain are local companies with an actual business very related to the city and with local customers or customers from abroad but intending to do something within Paris.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: I can only agree with that. There are certainly mostly small businesses and retail that use it. I think Ghent is more difficult perhaps than Paris or Barcelona or New York or has more challenge to use .gent internationally because Ghent is not so much known. Everybody knows New York or knows Barcelona. But if we are active on an international scale or another company or another stakeholder is active on an international scale, then people might ask, “What is .gent?” So that’s harder for us than for a big city. Also, linguistically, Gent also means gentleman in English. So then we also had the discussion should we have Ghent with an “h” like the English word version or not? But then you get two URLs and two e-mail addresses, so it becomes even more complex. So for us it’s also linguistically it can be a challenge.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: I have a question.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Sorry. May I?

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Yeah, of course.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Don’t be too impressed about what things mean in English. Imagine .cat and what it means in English. And all the jokes that we had to stand for years and years. Still it works. So be courageous. Use your name.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: I'd like to think about the identity, the sense of belonging that this domain may represent to citizens. In New York, you say 51% are individuals, and in Berlin they were talking about only 20%. That is so curious. What's the difference? You professionals from the domains, what do you think about this different situation?

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Please go ahead.

HARTMUT SCHULZ: [Hartmut for Cologne], we have around about the same as New York. We have around about 50% private persons. I think the reason is that when we started with the domain and we had a big campaign focusing on private people and we had them right from the start on. So I think it's basically the way you go into the market.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: And the price.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: And the price, of course.

LORI ANNE WARDI: We didn't have any special campaign. But I guess our branding around "Own It," like self-empowerment, it could have been similar.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: There's also something related to the market prior to this existing. United States and New York is an area where people buy more domains, .com or .nyc, for many years than in Cologne or Barcelona or Ghent. And even then there's a difference between Germany, Belgium, Spain, Portugal. So individuals in Europe tend to have less domains than in the United States. As Lori Anne said, individuals are not always what we think about as an individual, a private individual. Individuals very often are small enterprises, solopreneurs. And the market there is more mature, has much more offering therefore. Also, the access price not just for domains but hosting and other related services is lower, which helps a lot as well.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: With the number of businesses and individuals, I think we tracked it really down to the actual website. We didn't only look on the organization field and private persons field, but we looked on the websites and really identified all those doctors, architects, and designers which just have their name and private address but using it for a business purpose. So that's why these numbers came up.

I have a question to all of you. I heard something about digital identity, digital brand, digital tool. What is a TLD for you? Is it a tool, identity, brand, or something different?

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Well, all in one.

LORI ANNE WARDI: I think in New York it's what you make it. It's a platform. It's a possibility. It's a platform for possibility. So if you want it to be – we've seen people put their own personal bio on their .nyc. So they send people there like a resume. So for them it's their identity, it's their bio. For others, they use it to build apps. It becomes more of a tool. That's a good question. I don't know that we've ever given it too much thought. But we do think of just the .nyc as a platform, and we try to get people excited about using it and just affiliating themselves with the brand. But I don't know that we've thought through. That's a good question to think further about.

CONSOL VANCELLS: I agree. To me, it's always the same. Brand is everywhere. So when you say Barcelona, you have the tool, the platform, the Internet tool, the digital tool, the [inaudible]. You have any kind of tool. The brand is everywhere. So those are channels you can use for the brand. And obviously the digital channel is the most important one [of these], but brand is perception so it's everywhere.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Do we have any more questions? Oh, yeah, please. Go ahead.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: You said about anyway in Barcelona you are having the new branding strategy coming out next couple of days, weeks, or whatsoever. Will the

logo for .barcelona [be] the same as for the city of Barcelona or will they be different?

CONSOL VANCELLS: That's a very interesting question.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: No, I've just seen in Ghent....

CONSOL VANCELLS: No, that's a very interesting question because the brand, the name Barcelona, does not belong to the city council. The city council is one of the stakeholders of the brand. So we are the ones – pardon me?

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: We're the citizens.

CONSOL VANCELLS: We're the citizens, absolutely. So the brand is alive. It belongs to no one. So we, the city councils, are one of the stakeholders trying to help everyone to identify what is our identity, our DNA, and to show it through a signature. I prefer to say the word signature instead of logo. I always put an example, for instance, we were in Grenoble last week with Eurocities. I was showing a picture with the signature of Coco Chanel. When you see that signature. When you see that signature of Coco Chanel, it comes to your mind many things of her personality which is different to each one of us. But it's a way of expressing in a

single design the [richness] of the content of Coco Chanel through a signature. So for us, we are working on a signature of Barcelona which is very much related to the domain of Barcelona which is going to be the minimal expression of the richness of the content of Barcelona which is so difficult to express in such a small “I Love New York” symbol or a small “I amsterdam” or whatever. So next year in Rio, we’ll show you.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: [inaudible]

CONSOL VANCELLS: Is it in Rio? The ICANN congress next year? No?

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: [inaudible]

CONSOL VANCELLS: Oh, I thought it was in Rio. Sorry. Maybe I was – where is it next year?

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: The next one is Kobe.

CONSOL VANCELLS: Kobe? Whatever.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: She'll see you wherever it is.

CONSOL VANCELLS: See you there.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: So do we have more questions for the panel? No more? I just have one – oh, yeah?

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: No, no. If you have no questions, since I really have to run in two minutes, I just wanted to take 30 seconds to thank you for coming. Thank you for making this afternoon a first in the ICANN meeting. I hope it will be only the first. Be bold. Probably you don't need an ICANN meeting to think about having something similar outside tagging it on other events or your own. I think the topics we discussed are extremely relevant. The place in a general discussion and reflection about the evolution of the Internet, I think you are a good stakeholder on that. So thank you again, and hope to see you. I won't be in Kobe, but if you come to an ICANN meeting and you want to have something similar, I will be happy to help you organize that. And if you don't want to come to an ICANN meeting or you can't and you want to still organize it outside, you can still come to ICANN on that. Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Thank you.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]